

;;;BOSTON CITY COUNCIL

;;;THURS 5.2.2019

;;; 3:00 - 5:30 PM

>> Michael Flaherty chair of committee on government operations.

Today is thus May 2nd.

We're here to discussion docket 348 regarding equity in the city of Boston.

This is stream lined.

>> This body passed equity in the city of Boston ordinance.

It was signed into law by mayor Walsh.

This ordinance included changes to the RFP process of the city and requirements of quarterly reporting, procurement projects today.

Number of contracts entered into it and those owned by women, people of color and Boston residents.

Today's hearing is to discuss the results.

I turn it over to Michelle WU and Kim Janey for additional opening comments and then get into it.

We have our first panel here.

Welcome to all of you from the administration.

I will give my colleagues a opportunity to give us their thoughts.

Michelle WU.

>> Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Thank you for making sure we had a expedited time in the chamber given the busyness of budget season.

Thank you for all of staff for accommodating that.

Thank you to the panelists and co sponsor, Kim Janey, to keeping the attention on this.

This is one of the most important ordinances that I worked on during my time on the council.

This is entirely in the city's

control directing where our tax payer dollars are going and a lining them with larger goals to create, generate and grow wealth in our community particularly for businesses owned by people of color, women, local Boston residents.

Having the numbers was extremely Aye opening from November 2018 and seeing it looks like there may of been adjustments.

The numbers of contracts by, designated by minority business enterprises, state and local business enter prices, less than one percent each or one percent each of the cities entire spent discussion airy spending.

Looking forward to digging into those.

Hearing the update ask appreciate my colleagues time in the administration.

I know you live and breath this. We're lucky to get a little of your insight on how to continue to move forward.

We will get above one percent and a lot higher beyond that as well.

Locking forward today's conversation with all community leaders in the room.

>> Thank you, counselor WU. Chair recognizes counselor Kim Janey.

>> Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you to counselor WU for her partnership on this issue, dating back to before I arrived on the city council.

Acknowledge Ayanna Pressley for Herrin yesterday I believe work.

I'm deeply committed to this.

I want to be sure our close to one billion dollars we spend as a city does end up in the hands of people who live in our city.

People of color and women Entrepreneurs.

Looking forward to a productive hearing.

Thank you.

I want to acknowledge the panelists and community advocates as well.

>> Thank you.

Chief, good to see you again.

>> Good afternoon chairman Flaherty, counselor WU and counselor Janey.

I'm John Bowers, chief of economic development foresight of Boston.

To my left is SALINA, director of equity and inclusion.

To my right is Stacy Williams, the certification manager.

On behalf of me and Martin J.

Walsh, thank you for the opportunity to discuss equity in the city's procurement process. Mayor Walsh has taken several steps making sure business conducted in the city and by the city have equity number of women and people of color participants.

Given the city's incredible spending power of close to a billion dollars, it's imperative we have municipal policies promoting engaging with women owned and minority owned businesses, particularly for our own contracts.

This effort is not without challenges.

As you know, with respect to construction, Boston did have a robust and successful program requiring general contractors to award 15% of the total contract to minority owned businesses and 5% to women owned businesses. Unfortunately, the program was eliminated due to a court ruling in the early 000s.

Our WBE and NBE numbers have never recovered.

However, we have identified and are working on several policies to reverse the troubling trend.

To begin, we're in the process of conducting the city's first disparate study since 2003 to identify and address gaps in the

city's procurement practice as cross all departments and provide an enhanced platform for future equity based policies. In additionally October of 2018 mayor Walsh announced the department of neighborhood development and Bostons planning and PBA will include diversity, inclusion, and -- all requests for proposal release of public land moving forward.

The first was the four RFPs released for land in the Dudley square area.

We have successfully received applications from very diverse development groups.

We're very happy with the first leg of response.

I also want to encourage an open dialogue and partnership with the council.

So that we can look at and address the state's procurement laws.

Specifically chapter 30B requiring Boston to accept the lowest bid for any, any contract over ten thousand dollars.

We should and must have the ability to take into account more factors when selecting contractors.

In reassess 30B it's my hope to provide the city with the flexibility needed to make a meaningful impact on our spending powers.

I am optimistic that the disparity study coupled with an assessment coupled with procurement laws will improve city contracts awarded to women and people of color.

I do want to be clear however it's not all bad news.

As you will hear from the director of equity inclusion Selina's presentation there will be improvements in numbers. Slight and somewhat immaterial but TRENding in the right direction.

This is being done by creating strong partnerships with equity inclusion unit and departments such as public works.

And parks.

We are eager to participate you on this work.

Yielding additional successes prior to the disparity study and other pop see discussions.

At this point I want to turn it over to Selina for more specifics on our efforts.

>> Welcome, Salina.

>> Good afternoon.

My name is Selina BARoS MILNER.

I wanted to share with you a little more about what we're doing to both develop the supply of women and minority vendors and create demand.

I will go through and start off in the presentation with a look at the current certified vendor pool.

>> The different categories of certification we do.

I put a place here for the different types.

MBEs are businesses 51% minority owned.

We have a total of 304 of those.

144 are Boston based businesses.

Women owned we have 214 of those 50 are Boston based.

Small and local business enterprises which that certification is about both the size of the business in terms of the gross receipts as well as their being located in Boston.

We have 213 small and local businesses.

199 are based in Boston.

Then we have veteran owned businesses both include veteran owned small businesses as well as disabled veteran owned small businesses.

Those are 93 bases in Boston.

If you're pulling out your calculators I guarantee the numbers won't add up.

A lot of these categories

overlap.

If you see within minority owned this are women owned and male owned businesses.

So within small and local some are minority owned, etcetera, etcetera, this is a glimpse of doing current vendor pull in the certification database managed by Stacy.

There is a lot of room to grow.

A lot of room to diversify.

One of the steps we have taken towards that is partnership with the commonwealth.

Their supplier diversity office.

They do certification for the state.

We signed a MoU with them in December of 2018 formally establishing a cross certification agreement and process between the two agencies.

Now if you're certified with one of the -- the state or city the other party will recognize that certification and fast track your certification process through them.

We are looking to A sign our data system.

So if someone is looking for a minority owned business we're in talks for.

That we're looking to make the process more business friendly and stream lined.

Certification is not the end.

The contract is the end.

We want this to be as smooth as possible.

This will create contract opportunities for our vendors.

We also launched this year the economic development center.

Our unit launched the pathways to city contracting series.

That consisted of a opportunity fare where business owners could learn about opportunities coming up.

Also a series of technical assistance workshops.

You can see the types of information and member of attendees.

So far we have had 452 members come through.

All of the workshops are free of charge and available to the public.

Just to take a look who has participated in the workshops.

We have a racial breakdown on the left and gender breakdown on the right.

Majority African-American.

Hispanic.

White, Asian.

Other.

Majority male.

Male and female participation.

Those are the neighborhoods when we track participant data. those are the neighborhoods that participants reside in.

We had the first opportunity fair in the building in Dudley.

It was good to see people from all across the city.

These are quotes people made.

Meaningful connection.

It was priceless information.

This is just a little deeper look at the opportunities.

You can see how we took advantage of this not opening yet.

We were able to use the great space in the street level of the bowling building.

You see the commitment from departments really wanting to get out there and meet folks.

That particular event we had 250 vendors and residents come through.

For us it's not just enough to have the events but follow people through getting a city contract.

This is an example of a initiative with the department of public works.

We're partnering with contracts prior to them coming out.

Working with them to see how the

contracts can be more inclusive for businesses of different sizes and ownership.

The two RFPs we have worked on so far one was the -- landscaping RFP and the other was a recycling cart delivery.

The partnership is from the beginning to the end.

First we look at the contract size, itself.

We see if there is a way to make it in the recycling cart example they broke it up into two contracts to cover east and west parts of the city, north and south.

That's a contract that would have been larger.

That was a contract that was bundled into the sanitation contract.

A multi million dollar contract.

The specific replacement of the recycling carts they were like this is something that doesn't have to be bundled into this.

Let's separate this out.

You need a pickup truck.

You need this amount of space.

You need dry storage.

We came up with a criteria and discussed how it would be more inclusive for a smaller business owner getting started.

That went out to bid

April 18th.

We were able to work prior to that on the RFP language.

On outreach.

We have an outreach manager, Joshua Mcfad in.

He reached out to landscapers and hauling businesses.

We did a neighborhood information system.

Most RFPs have a information system attached.

A lot are in the department where it's offered.

This had a information session in the department of public works.

We were able to use the Boston

water and sewer building
5-7:00 p.m. not during the
workday but at a more convenient
time for people.

Despite the efforts we learned
we need to further diversify the
vendor pool.

We didn't have a lot in our
existing database.

We were limited in who we
thought had the criteria
required for the contracts.

In addition we saw given the
bids that were submitted.

Proposals submitted that there
is a strong need for capacity
building.

Either people getting them in
late, wrong format, small
things.

So now we have, this is a lotted
thanks to Joshua's leadership.

From A-Z how to fill it out.

Format and page number.

All of what you need.

It's the type of thing if you're
a minute late you're out.

>> If you miss a form you're
out.

We are designing a new series to
meet that.

Another new initiative is the
next initiative is sector
specific sources.

We're doing a partnership with
commonwealth kitchen to certify
their businesses that use this
space.

So that will be the first time
we're doing a sector specific.

A ton of opportunities for
restaurants and catering
companies to do business with
the city.

We have trainings to GALAS to
all kinds of events where we
need food.

That is a new tish Tiff.

Trying to match the vendor pool
to, to the need.

Thank you.

So we have a certification event
at commonwealth kitchen.

June 4th, 5-7:00 p.m.

We're still confirming details.
We will support businesses there on becoming a city vendor.
That's a small hurdle we have noticed through our work.
You can't do business with the city if you're not in the city vendor.
That's an easy process.
Easier than being certified as a woman owned business.
It can take you ten minutes to walk someone through it we will make sure the businesses are city vendors as well.
You can't pay someone if they're a city vendor.
We are finding the gaps for specific interventions.
The next piece is the quarterly data that we're here to discuss.
I won't read through the numbers.
This covers the first quarter of FY19.
You can see the comparison in November.
You can see as the chief mentioned the numbers of contracts are going up for MBEs, WBEs, small and local businesses.
The trend is going in the right direction.
It's still willfully under what it should be but this is a glimpse where we are now.
>> To be clear the FY19 first quarter is compared to the FY18 year.
So this is showing trend and the move.
>> Do have a first quarter 18?
>>
>> We can get that to you.
>> We will get that to you.
>> That's trending.
>> Trending in the right direction.
However recognizing we are way -- we have a lot of work to do.
>> And you see a increase of first quarter 2018 --

>> The number of contractors.
We think that's where the work
has to be.

The willingness to contract is
there.

The number of contractors is
not.

We have done historic work to
look at where the numbers.

How many certified MWBEs the
city had in the database before
it dismantled the MWBE program
in the early two thousands.

More people were available for
city contracts.

Women and minority owned
business compared to today.

Clearly as the shifts shifted
the goals and limited goals
we see eliminated businesses in
Boston.

Over the last couple of decades
we have decimated women owned
and minority owned businesses
that would apply for the bids.

We have a lot of work to do.

This is why you hear about the
efforts to certify and create
more capacity in the space doing
business with the city.

>> Okay.

>> This is a little more
detailed information about the
disparity that the chief
mentioned.

We have completed phase one.
December 2018.

The goal of phase one was to
really assess the quality of the
city's data and viability of the
disparity study.

Just making sure we had the
necessary data available to
analyze.

It took a preliminary look at
the MWBE discussion they spent
data. In the initial field
they had the information they
need to move forward.

Phase two was looking at the
market and generating the
availability of those providing
services to procure.

Now who is available out there

to perform the work.

That's what that is about.

It results in new programs for
dissipate findings.

I want to highlight that we're
doing the disparity study and
partnership with several other
departments including the
procurement office, Boston of
housing and public works and
BPDA.

The last S I couldn't get a
picture of everyone on the team.

Our team is changing and
growing.

We have an outreach manager.
Compliance manager, Jess darks
not in this picture.

She's camera shy.

And rich, the program monitor.

He works with city departments
to find out about contracts
coming up and monitor the
spending.

We also have been approved for a
position for our certification
work in the FY20 budget.

>> The mayor has included an
additional position.

We're asking for your support
and vote in the affirmative in
that position when you get the
chance to do such.

>> Thank you.

>> Thank you.

>> Anything else to add?

Stacy, anything additional?

>> -- prior to the program
changing there were Mora vail
ability of women and minority
businesses.

Particularly in the area of
contracting for construction
projects.

So, after that as we have been
moving forward to engage the
businesses.

Small businesses and help them
we have found there are fewer
and they're looking for
technical assistance.

We are able to offer and provide
for them.

>> Thank you, chief.

Thank you, Stacy.

>> A couple quick questions.

We have been joined by Matt O'Malley as well.

What contracts do we spend the most money on.

What contracts is that money going to?

>> The biggest ones are public works.

Neighborhood development.

Boston public schools.

Here we go.

Police and do it.

Those are our top five.

I didn't make that slide.

I want to mention we recently applied for the living cities inclusive procurement accelerator.

Cities get technical assistance and they're part of nine other cities to learn from each other about inclusive procurement practices.

And it provides in-kind and financial assistance for inclusive -- we are looking to create a inclusive procurement council.

In that proposal we have the department that's I listed for the most part.

BPS, purchasing do it.

All have gone into the application with us.

If we're selected for the program we will work with five other city departments to create a procurement council and create new best practices in a consolidated buying plan which the city of Boston has never had.

>> Very good.

This maybe a function of the first quarter versus the snap of the year.

I notice the percentage of women owned business, minority and small businesses have grown minimally in 2019.

The number is less than fiscal year 18.

Can you explain to me why that's the case.

>> The actual contracts.

>> Correct.

>> That is a function of the quarter.

Versus the year.

The quarter we have more than half.

More than half of contracts already then we had in 2019.

I mean 2018.

It sets up for a favorable year.

You're right.

The 19 verse 28 is a function of the time frame.

>> You mentioned chapter 30B with respect to any contract over 30,000.

You suggesting flexibility in increasing contracts under 25,000 or under 50,000 or a hundred thousand or should we have discretion through 30B.

>> Low bid should be one of the factors not the only factor taken into consideration.

Past experience with a contractor on city contracts should be included as that.

The ability for the contractor to respond should be included in that.

That would allow city goals.

Allowing us to look at policy and practices and take into consideration along with the low bid and recommendation for contracting.

>> And helping with technical assistance and things that had nature how much is financing.

How much is bonding.

How much is insurance for companies to compete to accept the types of contracts.

The vendors need the assistance.

How much is financing, workers comp.

Those factors and figures come into play if someone wants to step in and play in this arena.

Are you seeing a lot that had as a deterrent.

>> Anecdotally each industry has its challenges for participation.

The construction industry has bonding issues.

A big challenge.

A challenge in the construction space is back office.

What you have for the smaller owned businesses you have excellent trades and skills.

When it comes to paper work and back office part of this it's -- you have a small shop.

You have to figure out how to do that.

The other part is in bonding.

It continues to be a challenge that we see.

Working capitol and all across the board is a challenge when you have a contract from the city that is larger than the typical contract.

You have to step up.

The working capitol and small loan is always critical.

Depending on this.

-- the city hasn't had these goals besides construction.

After this disparity study we will set for the first time in city history goals in services and products.

We will then begin to understand the challenges and nuances in different industries, speaking better to construction give our history and work done there.

We notice the nuance with business development in general.

>> A little more involved than shark tank with a great idea and a investor.

You need working capitol.

Front of the house, back of the house, technical pieces, HR.

Hopefully people are getting a grasp on how that works and the financing to support.

That.

>> Also something I know the BPDA is looking at.

We want to make it part of the

accelerator.

Even if we're not selected on how we set the insurance rates for different contracts and seeing if they're set to high it seems to have been done in a historical fashion.

Those are pieces we want to be strategic about.

>> Counselors, open for questions.

>> Thank you, chairman and everyone.

I want to, just cut me off.

I have a couple of rounds of buckets of questions.

So clarify my understanding of some of the terminology in terms of SLDE.

Small and local.

Is that the best measurement of a Boston based business?

I was confused with the total number of 213 and then a smaller number of Boston based.

I would of thought this had to be Boston based.

>> Some call phi for small business --

>> Can you speak into the microphone.

We have a difficult time hearing.

Thank you.

>> Some businesses that apply for certification qualify for a small business.

They may not be within Boston.

>> Even the 199 that are Boston based are still small.

>> Yes.

>> What is the best way to understand total Boston based businesses even if they're not a MBE or WBE or veteran BE.

>> That's a good question.

>> Yes Boston based.

>> So we have 40,000 registered businesses in Boston that meet small business definition.

>> What is the cut off again?

>> The 40,000 in the small business report.

Counselor, I will give you my

best record.

I don't have it in front of me.

I will forward the report to you.

I believe how thousand registered that included.

A majority are single proprietary businesses.

>> Zol proprietary businesses.

>> Yes.

I register as a business.

>> Is there a cut off?

>> 5 million and under.

So that's the universe.

That is just small business.

>> We have 610 total certified businesses in the database.

A lot have multiple of the types of certifications.

610 so could be certified by the city but not a Boston owned city.

>> So historically city and state governments, you had to be certified by the EBT it to do business in the city.

You have to be certified by Boston.

What is changing now.

I think it's the wave of the future.

We don't want certification to be a barrier.

We don't have the partnership of the state.

But the state has with other certifying entities the state has done similar MoUs.

If you are proven to be a minority owned business and this is what they do, great.

We trust the profit.

You don't have to do a Boston certification.

You want to make sure it's willing legitimate and then move on.

Then count to a goal in the future if we have the ability to have goals set in place.

To clarify on the denominator we're talking about.

FY18 around \$774 million.

That's the discretion spend from

purchasing and procurement but not from the capitol budget.

Is that correct.

>> I think it's both.

>> Does it include all of the capitol contracts too.

>> No.

That here, this includes all of the contracts.

Looking to make sure.

It's architecture engineering, capitol construction.

Other professional serves.

The, I believe the total includes construction activity as well.

Okay.

>> What is not captured and is important is the subcontractor work.

>> Can you go into detail what that means.

>> So the primary contractors -- contracts are awarded to the primary applicant.

They would often sub their work.

Often that's the case in construction.

You have a GC come in and build a library.

They sub contract to a group that's good with plumbing or electrical.

So on and so forth.

What we haven't done over the years is capture well whether those sub contractors are women and minority owned businesses.

>> That's because the general contractor -- the general contractors were no longer failing by the city contract. Sub contract to minority and five to women.

They pretty much stopped.

So that is why a lot of the minority and women business that's actually were

construction related businesses went out of business, worked with someone else or retire.

That is one of the things that caused our pool of certified businesses to drop dramatically.

Also caused the dollar amounts that we were able to record to drop.

They're paid by the general contractor but not caught by the auditing system.

So this comes from the general contractor.

>> So right now we're not capturing right, what I will anecdotally say to you is a lot of money going to subs.

That is how the work is done.

Minority owned or women owned.

Historically that's where the money goes.

What we do is establish new goals like in the past and demand that we get that information to be able to report that to you.

>> We are not sure we're missing.

That it sounds like it could be one of two things.

Either we're under counting.

The money is going to subs and we don't know.

I thought I heard that the under tone is a lot of the contractors.

A lot of the supply of MWBEs dissipated because there was no requirement to prove you used a sub.

They may not go there anymore.

>> Yes.

That is true.

These are both true.

One is we're not counting some of the contracts because of the sub contractors.

Two is the number of sub contractors have dissipated because we don't have the goals.

These are final numbers for FY18.

\$664 million including all of the capitol contracts and everything else.

The payer this is printed on work on the plaza, etcetera, it looks like there were slight revisions to the reports in

November.

Actually adjusted what was done.

She pointed out it was 70%.

It was .72%.

That number is down to

.55 percent in terms of the contracts going to people of color by number and .65 percent of the dollar value.

These are the numbers?

>> I will look at what we presented in November and let you know the discrepancy.

>> Is this the format that you anticipate the quarterly reports will start coming in.

The second update after the November 28th report.

They called for quarterly reports.

I wanted to confirm if this is the chart you are working off of or is there another report format.

>> This is our proposed.

He want to be helpful in the discussion and make sure you get what you need.

We would love to hear feedback of what is helpful and not helpful and make sure it's consistent enough to look at one report versus other reports.

>> I guess the only part in editing this chart I would like to see a clean break out of is the Boston based piece.

Both by contracts --

>> I would like a apples to apples first quarter 18, first quarter 19.

The trend in that direction as well.

>> I have more questions.

I will squeeze in one more for this section if it's okay

Mr. Chair and Madam co sponsor.

In terms of the disparity study.

The disparity study went out in October of 2018 in terms of the RFP, right.

Are you saying that since October to 17 the progress is that we will see it done by

2020.

Recommendations back by 2020 for new policies.

>> Yes, to 17.

We made selections early 2018.

We signed a contract 2018.

The fact first was to make sure we had the data for a disparity study.

In 2003 the study came back in conclusive.

The popular talking point is that Boston didn't have disparities.

That is not correct.

It dismantled our programs.

We didn't have the data to back up our goals.

That's why it was in conclusive.

We didn't have the data and lost it in court.

That put us in the problem we're in today.

We didn't want to launch another disparity study without the data and be in the same predicament.

This sets all cities back.

We wanted to make sure we had that.

Phase one was completed.

Recently we got a report back on the data we do have, what's clean, what's available.

So the study we do run answers the questions we are asking.

And you nowhere the mayor have to worry about a in conclusive disparity study.

>> What is the data that came back.

>> The research we did has data here that is good and data here that's good.

We have good data.

We have been working on that.

Ever since we came into the administration.

We learned why the 2003 disparity study came back in conclusive.

We have worked hard to make sure we are collect the good data. we put out an RFP.

Brought in a team to look at the

data and confirm it was good enough for a study.

They did that.

They sent back the report.

We are now launched the study.

>> Could you share that first phase since it's done with the council?

>> It's a pretty simple thing.

We could get something written for you.

For the first phase.

>> Thank you.

>> Thank you.

A quick question before we turn over to counselor Janey.

There is, the opportunity fair.

17 city departments were represented.

I think you indicated 452 folks attended?

>> The number of folks that participated in the whole series.

The opportunity was the first one.

It was 250, I believe.

We know everyone of the 452 was awarded a contract for the city.

>> We don't have data on that now.

We have the ability to follow-up on some.

We did business in take.

The other piece we did is a partnership with Suffolk construction.

They had the trade partnership series.

That prepares businesses to do joint ventures with Suffolk.

It's pretty successful.

Out of the program we prequalified thee of the business that's did.

>> Moving forward keeping track of that I think that's important.

>> We do have.

>> We're building excitement around that and it would be great for folks to participate in that the contracts awarded.

>> Council Flaherty we have last

summer.

Last summer we ran the pilot.
We will get you that number off
the top of my head.

We celebrated HP plumbing.
A minority owned local plumbing
company that received a ten
thousand dollar contract from
the city.

I want to get back to you.
We tracked from last summer.
Last summer success is why we
scaled the program up and are
doing more of it.

>>Thank you.

Chair recognizes co-chair woman
counselor Janey.

>> Thank you.

Following up on the fair.
I attended the event at bowling.
It was wonderful.

Good job, Selina.

Thank you for your hard work as
well as the team.

Just fog up on the folks
following up on 450.

Those attended some event.

What else is happening in terms
of follow-up?

We did a business in take form
for them.

There are vendors and residents
that were finding out what the
city was doing.

Of the businesses.

>> How many were actual
businesses hoping for a contract
for the city versus residents --

>> I would love to have that
data. we had our tablets crash.

People were doing manual sign it
we tried to capture as much.

Unfortunate hee that was a big
hit.

Such a large number of people
there.

From the first event we don't.

The rest are vendors in the
cities.

We did business in take form.

We said the types of services
you provide, the type of help
you need.

All of the demographic

information.

We are tracking that information and referring them to either certification, partner programs and also working with the small business unit which is, you know, right on the same floor at 26 court street.

A sign people to other technical assistance they provide.

Our unit is focused on opportunity matching.

Where we see gaps we're able to get people over to natalya and the small business team.

I don't have numbers.

>> In terms of the certification what is the support that people get.

>> I come across the few MBEs and WBEs that are not registered or certified with the city how do we help people with that process.

>> Stacy you want to talk about the support of your team.

>> So certification basically --

>> That is when they come to us. Often times they're newly created.

They're just starting out.

Besides helping them maneuver through the application itself.

Was this are five criteria and they have to meet all five criteria.

Then what I do is introduce them to whether it's a different department that will utilize the services provided.

Put them in contact with the kept or if they need assistance like maybe help with their books or marketing and things like that.

We refer them to the main street units.

So it depends on what the business needs from us at the time.

And the type of services.

>> Just to clarify, counselor.

It's important to say publicly and to repeat.

This are two processes.
One you have to be a vendor with
the city to do any city
business.

It's really important that
people do that.

I believe it's done through the
procurement office.

Our small business managers help
with that process.

It's it's a important process.

Second airily it's important,
but notness, you get certified
as a MWB.

We love to help, we love to
track, we love to get them Mora
sis stance and we ask them to
certify with our office.

>> That is helpful.

>> Sorry, I wasn't done.

Once they're certified the
company name is listed in the
directly.

All city departments have access
to it.

Others who are private agencies
and entities have access and
they call our access looking for
lists.

We notify them about outreach
events happening with other
agencies.

Besides the city of Boston or
other opportunities for
workshops like access to capitol
and different things like that.

So whatever we can do to help.

>> Thank you.

I wanted to shift back to the
disparity study.

Can you talk us through the time
line again.

I heard you mention in response
to questions from counselor WU
we hoped 2020 for
recommendations.

Is that January 2020?

This march, last march the
contract was awarded.

What is happening.

Take us through to
recommendations.

>> Yes.

I wanted, I want to separation

and call it phase one and phase two.

Phase one of the contract will work with the city on the data and data sets.

They went through the data sets, looked at everything and what we wanted was to be assured the data is good enough for the quality of data you need to present to establish the Lowell framework.

What tripped us up in 2003 was not having good data to establish a disparity or not.

It was inconclusive.

They used the first year for the first phase.

We're now done.

The report because you have good data. The thing was we're not collecting enough on sub contractors.

Right.

The next phase is the legal study.

People lunch no a disparity study.

The next is the disparity study that typically takes about a year.

That will be done end of this year, early next year.

>> Good.

That is helpful.

On the sub contractors piece.

At least with the construction industry we have that information.

So through the BRAQ where we track the subs and whether they meet business in terms of minority and women why not cross-reference at least for the construction field?

Is that something you can do.

>> It's tricky BRPG tracks hours worked not spend.

>> I'm very interested in spend.

Great.

>> So I do think that we are interested in looking at whether if this is a minority owned or women owned sub to count

favorably towards someone
getting a awarded a contract.

The WRP language.

I think that's the next step for
BJRP and construction in
general.

It's not an easy
cross-reference.

Even if we were to know a sub
was a minority or a woman we
wouldn't know the money spent.

They're tracking work hours.

>> Why not track the spend?

I mean I think that is
important.

>> It is important.

>> Last year we count the hours
and it's important.

There would be huge differences
depending whether or not it's a
union shop versus a non union
shop.

What is considered low skilled
labor and highly skilled labor.

Important to know the actual
spend.

I think.

>> Super important to know the
actual spend.

>> Is that something you will
move forward on.

Is that something you look to do
to track the spend?

>> Not until this is done and
the legal to back the demand of.

That because we didn't have that
in 2000 the program was struck
down.

We weren't here.

We didn't have thely framework
for collecting and mandating the
goals.

We lost the programs.

We want to wait for the program
to return and establish a
program collecting the right set
of data and demanding the right
sat of data.

On the other create the right
demand setting up goals for
people to meet.

>> I want to come back to the
FY18.

The report that we received on

November 1st of last year.

The numbers are different from your powerpoint presentation today.

I am not sure why that is.

Perhaps we can come back up as a follow-up.

>> When I look at the presentation today it's point 55% where as the November 1st, 2018 report.

>> Is that anything indicating the time frame for the 72%?

A quarterly report.

>> It's not my understanding it was a quarterly report.

That being said.

>> It couldn't be a yearly report.

>> It's dated November 1st.

The problem is this number is higher.

This is higher then the report.

>> We could of spent more money.

The important thing is to get something consistent.

So you are consistently seeing the same time frame.

>> I apologize.

>> You mentioned earlier the top five departments in terms of spending.

The public works, neighborhood development, neighborhood police and do it.

What are the top actual contracts.

Is it paper for example we spend the most on.

What do we spend the most on.

>> In general.

>> Ya.

>> We will have to get back to you.

>> What type of businesses are getting the contracts.

>> The MWB contract.

>> Yes.

>> We do have other initial analysis from the disparity study.

The top three industries.

The first is construction.

Second is professional services

and third is goods and standards services.

They didn't list it in order.

We have the breakdown in the industries.

But professional serves.

The major are IT services.

Engineering and educational services.

Then goods and services which I think most people think of when they think of M and WBE.

There is the transportation cost, and those are the top three.

It's, it's much more complex than that.

Those are the top three.

>> Just a couple of more questions if I may.

The 30B that you mentioned.

That's in the construction world this.

Is something we have to deal with all of the contracts regardless of --

>> Okay.

>> So I would love to work with you in changing that.

I think that's important.

That can be a barrier to what it is we all hope to do here.

>> We have done important work in Roxbury with the planned WRFPP.

Getting Lang Ang from the mayor.

Inclusion and anti-displacement language for par sells going out.

What is the city doing.

Is this something we're waiting for the disparity study on.

Can we be proactive and strengthen the language now in terms of the RFPs going out?

>> I agree with you.

The work done in terms of plan Dudley was good work.

>> The mayor has announced that and will use that language.

I guess what I want to understand is when will we be used that language.

>> Is that coming in the future?

>> No the last RFPs issues were the WFPs.

>> Any afterwards will have that language.

>> Anti-displacement.
That was a good model as well many.

>> anti-displacement.

>> That is good to know.
I will pause now.

>> I will go back to the chair and --

>> Thank you very much.
I want to touch base on the transit and waste vehicles.
That's a big number when you think of float of vehicles, foul maintenance repairs, drivers. Teamsters and stuff like that.
It's a bigger and more complex situation diving into the business.
That's a interesting point.
50% is for those services.
Urges apologize we planned out the perfect hand off downstairs but the traffic foiled.

>> So I have to watch to run back down again.

>> In terms of the contracts and the year to year comparison.
I really appreciate the data we got this morning on the listing out contract by contract vendor name.
The amount.
The designation for fiscal year 18.
What I'm curious is how long the contracts are for.
Always a year at a time or multi year.
Some years may be when the contract terms are over.

>> We will have to get you a breakdown.

>> Thank you.

>> It would be great.
Even to get a column on this, what the planned end date is.
In terms of the contracts that we have.
Just in general a sense what had is the five year cycle looking

like.

What is the average contract length.

Do you happen to know.

One year contract?

Three year contracts?

>> Sometimes they're three year contracts.

One of the things in the report I receive besides contracts what it identifies are vouchers.

It could be one annual contract and every time work is done on the contract the payment is made.

You can have one contract that has ten payments on it.

That would be reflected in the whole report.

So it may not tell you when the contract begins or ends.

I can review the data they send me.

It will tell you at the end how much the contract was awarded for and how much was paid on it.

>> Okay.

That would be helpful.

I would be trying to build out maybe something you already.

Have something I think the community needs a mapping of when the different types of contracts come up.

If we're doing those great outreach events and training businesses, here are the opportunities to have.

Know that the next time it comes around won't be two to four years or however long it is.

>> That's the missing piece.

Knowing the timing.

So someone doesn't have to sit at a communitier daily to see the new ones that day are.

If we know looking ahead here is when this big trash hauling contract goes out or the recycling delivery cart happens.

>> That I think is how we actually connect the opportunities, the capacity you are doing a great job of

building up.

>> That's part of the plan and procurement council and our program monitor has sent out a survey to all departments.

We're trying to get back responsive on who does purchasing in the department.

What is your cycle.

Some departments one big GALA every year.

Others -- so, we're trying to get a handle on that from the survey and also doing this council.

That is one of the end goals to have a buy-in plan.

Most of those we're learning from other municipalities that have those in place.

Most are multi year.

For the next four years we know we need snow plows, salt, landscaping.

Those are recurring expenses.

So that is one of our.

If we don't get selected as part of the accelerator we will work on with the same team of people.

>> The other question I have is around the number of applicants.

Is this a way to know how many MBEs or WBEs applied for each contract and didn't get it, for example.

>> Yes.

That is also one of the things we're working on with the department.

Developing a way to get to them.

We help them do outreach.

We need feedback from them.

Who did you actually send out RPs and invitations for bids.

How in were MBEs WBEs, small and local, how many responded, who was awarded the contract and who wasn't and why.

That is something that we're working with the department --

>> That is something that we have heard that would be helpful in the community as well.

Even when you're not awarded the

contract.

Feedback on why and you know then they could incorporate that next time as well.

Also the metrics of how many are there that, is everyone going after the same kind of window of contracts.

-- the opportunities for a different contract.

Know the data on the number of applicants or bidders would be helpful too.

>> that's one of the things we learned from the landscaping information session and the responses to the request forbids.

>> Great.

Thank you.

>> Thank you, very much.

That will con cloud the panels.

Thank you, chief, director, deputy director somewhere you are welcome to stick around.

We have a second panel.

I thought I saw Joe here.

I know I saw others here as well participating in the second panel.

If you could make your way down.

Thank you to the administration.

We have public at the also.

See Joe, if Joe can work down here.

Joe is a distinguished attorney in Boston.

>> Welcome Joseph.

>> Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

>> I know -- was invited to participate as well.

-- public testimony. 15:03:47:03

I see Joe if you make your way 15:17:36:09
down here. 15:17:38:15

Joe is a former chair of our 15:17:39:03
licensing board and also 15:17:40:15
distinguished attorney in 15:17:42:27
Boston. 15:17:44:03

Welcome, Joseph. 15:17:57:12

>> Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 15:17:58:03

Please state your name and 15:18:00:15
affiliation for the record. 15:18:01:09

>> Yes. 15:18:02:09
I know we also Darnell Williams 15:18:02:24
is present of the urban league 15:18:04:24
was invited to participate as 15:18:06:03
was the director of Boston 15:18:07:24
Regina promise. 15:18:10:09
I do not see them here so both 15:18:11:18
of you gentlemen will represent 15:18:13:06
the second panel and then we 15:18:14:15
will transition after that to 15:18:15:24
questions from the public. 15:18:17:27
I also see more comments from 15:18:20:06
the public. 15:18:23:06
I see our colleague city 15:18:23:21
councilor Ed Flynn has also just 15:18:24:27
joined us as well. 15:18:26:21
So welcome to council, Mr. 15:18:27:18
Flynn. 15:18:31:12
Thank you. 15:18:32:03
>> Thank you very much, 15:18:32:12
Mr. Chairman. 15:18:33:18
0 Councilor Wu, councilor Janey, 15:18:34:15
councilor Flynn. 15:18:36:24
It is a pleasure to be here to 15:18:38:03
come to this chamber and also to 15:18:39:24
testify on this topic. 15:18:42:06
First and foremost -- and -- and 15:18:44:24
historical perspective for 15:18:52:12
having worked on this particular 15:18:54:06
issue administration in the 15:18:56:06
executive office of 15:19:04:15
administration of finance back 15:19:06:03
in 1983, and we created the 15:19:07:12
executive order 237 which was a 15:19:12:09
precursor to even what he was 15:19:15:03
able to do in putting together 15:19:18:09
an executive order during the 15:19:19:27
time of the late councilor FUJ 15:19:21:00
bowling. 15:19:24:27

So I think I would just want to 15:19:25:09
give that historical framework 15:19:26:24
to put the context in which the 15:19:28:06
reason why I believe I am here. 15:19:30:27
Going back to that particular 15:19:32:24
point in time, at that time with 15:19:33:27
the Dukakis administration what 15:19:36:00
we were looking to do is exactly 15:19:38:06
what the ordinance that is 15:19:39:15
before you and that we are speak 15:19:41:09
about today from the city 15:19:43:27
attempted to do and that was to 15:19:45:06
increase the minority and woman 15:19:46:12
business participation. 15:19:48:18

1983 was a different time than 15:19:50:12
when we are talking about now 15:19:53:15
and I will also speak to the 15:19:54:27
involvement I had with the city 15:19:56:24
during that period of time in 15:19:58:03
2003, when because of the case 15:19:59:09
law that was going on in the 15:20:02:24
country trying to dismantle 15:20:04:06
minority and woman business 15:20:06:00
programs, a lot of programs were 15:20:07:18
being challenged around -- 15:20:09:06
successfully around the country 15:20:10:27
and here in Boston we had to 15:20:12:21
reshape the program and make it 15:20:15:03
a small and local business 15:20:16:12
program. 15:20:18:06

And I can speak a little bit to 15:20:18:18
that because I was involved with 15:20:19:27
Brookwood and the administration 15:20:22:03
at that particular point in 15:20:23:24
time. 15:20:25:00

But as I said, because of the 15:20:26:00
involvement with designing, 15:20:27:12
codrafting the program for the 15:20:30:15
state, we assisted the city in 15:20:32:24
drafting its program which was 15:20:35:18
implement bed at this late 15:20:37:27
senator excuse me, the late 15:20:39:12
councilor bowling and bowling 15:20:41:06
bowling and members of the 15:20:43:03
council at that time and I 15:20:45:00
believe you were here as well, 15:20:45:24
councilor when that took place. 15:20:47:24
In and about 2003, as I talked 15:20:50:06
about here in the city, what had 15:20:52:24
happened was because, again 15:20:54:15

because of the case law and the 15:20:56:09
challenges the city felt it was 15:20:57:15
prudent to look at the minority 15:21:00:03
and woman business program 15:21:02:21
working along with Brookwood and 15:21:05:00
his team, in fact, Stacy was a 15:21:06:24
part of that effort as well, 15:21:09:06
Stacy Williams which testified a 15:21:11:00
moment ago was a part of that 15:21:12:21
particular effort, and what we 15:21:14:09
attempted to do was get a 15:21:16:06
program that would be, if you 15:21:17:21
will, bulletproof from being 15:21:19:06
attacked with regards to what 15:21:22:18
was going on around the country. 15:21:24:24
I don't know about the 15:21:26:24
implementation side of that 15:21:28:00

particular program. 15:21:29:15
There was, it was administered 15:21:30:24
by -- Woodson and his team but 15:21:32:12
in any event we had barb we 15:21:34:15
brought consensus within the 15:21:37:12
community in order to have that 15:21:39:21
program. 15:21:41:03
But as was stated here, as a 15:21:42:00
result of that, with the sense 15:21:44:18
of government having to step 15:21:46:24
back out of the process, what 15:21:48:21
was reported here, both by chief 15:21:50:27
Barrows and his team was the 15:21:52:18
fact that the number of 15:21:54:12
businesses diminished because 15:21:56:06
when government is not involved 15:21:57:21
in putting in place a program 15:21:59:24
which will deal with what you 15:22:01:21
can call it whatever you like, 15:22:03:09
minority or woman business or 15:22:04:24
call it small and local business 15:22:06:12
or call it disadvantaged 15:22:07:24
business. 15:22:09:03
You can call it whatever you 15:22:09:21
like, but if government doesn't 15:22:10:24
put certain requirements in 15:22:12:09
place it is just not going to 15:22:14:15
happen for minority women and 15:22:18:06
small businesses. 15:22:19:24
>> And that is the reason why I 15:22:20:24
am sure the numbers have been -- 15:22:23:09
have diminished. 15:22:25:00
So let me move to that 15:22:26:00

historical framework, which 15:22:28:06
brings us to what the council 15:22:30:06
put in place a number last year, 15:22:31:21
and now if you are locking at 15:22:34:15
what the administration can do. 15:22:36:21
So I think the most helpful way 15:22:37:27
I can be is being in this space 15:22:40:00
and knowing this area intimately 15:22:41:21
to make some suggestions as to 15:22:45:03
-- and many of them I heard 15:22:47:03
mentioned already, but I am 15:22:49:12
going to use my time well. 15:22:51:24
Lawyers use their time well so 15:22:53:09
even if I am repeating what has 15:22:54:21
already been saidly take credit 15:22:57:18
for it anyway. 15:22:58:27
So I think there are two areas 15:23:01:21
which have been implemented or 15:23:03:21
two programs implemented which 15:23:05:00
the city can look at and mirror. 15:23:07:00

One, the city has, Chief Barrows 15:23:09:27
mentioned about the department 15:23:12:21
of neighborhood development 15:23:14:15
programs they put in place with 15:23:16:12
regards to the -- well basically 15:23:18:06
the one-third, one-third, 15:23:21:24
one-third requirement which 15:23:23:03
resulted in a favorable result 15:23:23:24
of four bidders coming in and 15:23:26:12
meeting their the diversity or 15:23:29:12
inclusion requirements. 15:23:32:18
The other one was a precursor to 15:23:34:12
that and that was what Massport 15:23:37:09
did with regards to its 15:23:40:00
convention center. 15:23:41:12
It said, it put as a 15:23:42:00
qualification, one bidding and 15:23:45:00
put a number to it and said that 15:23:48:00
we want to have equity 15:23:50:00
participation in the project as 15:23:51:24
well as we want to make sure 15:23:53:18
that -- look at your minority 15:23:56:03
and woman utilization. 15:23:59:00
That was put in there and it had 15:24:00:18
a percentage in it which talked 15:24:02:21
about, not a percentage you had 15:24:05:18
to have but simply said when we 15:24:06:21
evaluate the contract, your 15:24:08:09
response to the RFP we are going 15:24:12:06
to be looking at -- we have put 15:24:13:24

a number of 15 percent is going 15:24:15:15
to be looked at for this 15:24:17:00
criteria. 15:24:18:06

Well, that resulted in many -- 15:24:19:09
numerous persons having the 15:24:21:15
opportunity to be investors in 15:24:22:27
that particular project, to have 15:24:25:09
-- to have business -- business 15:24:28:15
arrangements on their project in 15:24:31:00
certain ways, to be partners on 15:24:33:00
that project. 15:24:34:24

So that resulted in bringing it 15:24:35:12
about because of government 15:24:38:21
intervention. 15:24:40:00

Some of the things that were 15:24:41:15
mentioned here earlier and I 15:24:42:15
just will say that from a 15:24:44:21
governmental standpoint would 15:24:45:24
need to be done. 15:24:47:09

There is the assistance with the 15:24:49:00
bidding process. 15:24:52:15

Over the years, one, I was the 15:24:53:15
chair of the enhanced enterprise 15:24:57:15

community where we had the 15:24:59:24
pleasure of doing the Hampton 15:25:01:21
INN project, fish pier process, 15:25:03:18
Mecca mall, the health center in 15:25:06:24
the south bay. 15:25:09:03
One of the things, part of the 15:25:10:09
process and that was run by 15:25:11:27
Reggie Nunley at the time, what 15:25:13:00
the process was to provide 15:25:15:00
business assistance working 15:25:17:12
along with score and other 15:25:19:15
organizations to be able to 15:25:20:27
address some of that back office 15:25:22:27
situation which chief Barrows 15:25:24:18
talked about because a lot of 15:25:27:06
businesses have the skills but 15:25:28:12
they don't have the ability in 15:25:29:21
order to hire that back office 15:25:31:12
things which allows them to get 15:25:33:15
the bidding like a company like 15:25:34:21
John fish's company in Suffolk 15:25:36:27
construction has the back office 15:25:39:06
people who can provide that. 15:25:40:15
So they were providing some of 15:25:41:18
that assistance so I think 15:25:43:03
assistance in the business 15:25:45:03
process, some of the training 15:25:46:18

that was talked about here is 15:25:48:00
helpful, but we have to find a 15:25:49:15
way to bet more intimately 15:25:51:12
involved in what those 15:25:53:03
businesses may need and what we 15:25:54:00
can provide. 15:25:55:09
I think the other way in which 15:25:56:18
to do it is encouraging joint 15:25:58:12
ventures. 15:26:00:15
Again, that builds capacity. 15:26:01:03
When you have joint ventures you 15:26:03:06
have persons, some mention was 15:26:04:18
made here about bonding, bonding 15:26:06:24
has always been an impediment 15:26:10:06
particularly in a construction 15:26:12:03
industry in such time as there 15:26:14:15
have been requirements or 15:26:16:24
encouragement of joint 15:26:17:27
venturing, and so, therefore, 15:26:19:09
that allowed those who may have 15:26:21:03
the bonding capacity, bless you, 15:26:23:27
councilor. 15:26:25:24
>> Thank you. 15:26:26:06
>> Those who are putting them 15:26:26:15
together with persons who may 15:26:29:06
have the skill set but have yet 15:26:30:18

to develop the bonding capacity 15:26:32:12
and I can say there are examples 15:26:34:06
of those right here in terms of 15:26:36:15
projects that we have worked on, 15:26:38:21
one is Janey construction has 15:26:40:15
been able to do that very 15:26:41:27
effectively from starting from 15:26:43:09
where he was as a company to 15:26:45:12
where he is able -- where he is 15:26:47:00
at at this particular point in 15:26:49:00
time because of those 15:26:50:15
relationships in terms of joint 15:26:51:12
venturing and another one is 15:26:53:09
done right in terms of Anthony 15:26:54:21
Samuels has been another one who 15:26:56:27
has worked in the cleaning of 15:26:58:27
buildings and started here in 15:27:02:21
the city of Boston with his 15:27:04:09
contracting and now is a 15:27:06:09
multimillion-dollar company and 15:27:08:03
as a result of his having done 15:27:11:09
joint ventures so I strongly 15:27:12:21
encourage joint venturing for 15:27:14:00
building the capacity. The 15:27:15:15

other one is, oversight, 15:27:17:18
oversight in sanctions, if there 15:27:19:18
is not oversight and not 15:27:22:12
sanctions and/or the 15:27:23:18
encouragement it is not going to 15:27:25:15
be done. 15:27:27:03

The reason for the falloff from 15:27:27:21
2003 to the present time in so 15:27:29:21
many business going out of 15:27:31:21
business because they couldn't 15:27:33:06
get business and so, therefore, 15:27:34:09
if there is no oversight, there 15:27:36:09
are no sanctions, there is no 15:27:37:21
encouragement, we are having a 15:27:39:15
nice conversation, but, in fact, 15:27:41:12
that is about all that we will 15:27:43:15
have. 15:27:45:21

You won't see those numbers go 15:27:48:21
in the positive direction 15:27:50:03
because it just won't happen 15:27:52:06
unless those things are 15:27:54:21
happening. 15:27:55:24

One of the things is, dividing 15:27:56:15
the contracts into smaller sizes 15:27:58:21
when it is possible. 15:28:00:18

That was mentioned earlier and 15:28:02:03
yes that could be a possibility 15:28:03:03
there of some contracts that 15:28:05:09
lend themselves to that. 15:28:06:15

The contract criteria which I mentioned was one which said, fine.

We want to encourage there are joint ventures and we want to encourage and see what there is going to be in equity investment, et cetera so it is built into the contracts, I can assure you folks will respond favorably.

Bonding assistance I talked about, the timing of payments. That's the other thing.

A lot of businesses -- if the payments are six months away, most folks don't have the lines of credit to be able to carry their expenses over a period of time.

I can remember when I was in a

state government we worked with the controllers office to try to get a sense of, I am not sure if we got down to 60 days or 90 days but we were cognizant of the fact that businesses couldn't carry those contracts, you know, for -- for their payrolls or their expenses for a six-month period of time so they would get behind and they would get into issues.

They were getting into wage and hour issues so the efforts in order to give them the business may have been positive, but the impact on them was negative because they would submit their invoices and the period of time in which to get paid so that needed to be looked at.

And the last one, we lawyers are never considered on the contracts so therefore the professionals -- I heard it mentioned from chief Barrows that the program only spoke to construction.

Even the ones such as we had in the state which talked about, in the construction industry, the architects, the engineers, the

attorneys, no one has found an 15:29:47:03
effective way to include those 15:29:50:03
professions into this process 15:29:52:00
for the determination of it, at 15:29:53:21
least from what I have seen, if 15:29:54:27
I am incorrect on that, fine, 15:29:58:00
someone correct me but any 15:30:00:06
observation has been that that 15:30:02:03
has not been the case for 15:30:03:27
professional services. 15:30:05:21
So that would be an area as well 15:30:06:18
as chief Barrows said, they were 15:30:08:24
looking at more than just 15:30:12:06
construction and the city's 15:30:14:00
program that they may want to 15:30:16:03
look at the professional 15:30:17:15
services. 15:30:18:24
And I thank you for the 15:30:20:12

opportunity. 15:30:21:18

Thank you for inviting me to 15:30:22:00
testify here this afternoon. 15:30:23:12

>> And thank you, Joe, for the 15:30:24:12
value in the, adding value to 15:30:28:18
the discussion. 15:30:29:27

If you could state your name and 15:30:30:15
affiliation for the record and 15:30:31:21
give us your thoughts. 15:30:33:06

>> 22. 15:30:33:27

>> Good afternoon, my name is -- 15:30:34:18
and I am joining you today it is 15:30:36:00
a executive director of the 15:30:37:03
black and economic council of 15:30:39:09
Massachusetts. 15:30:40:24

I wish I had gone first. 15:30:41:15
I am not a lawyer but I am the 15:30:44:21
grandson of a Baptist preacher 15:30:46:15
and the son of a Baptist 15:30:48:06
minister, so I have translated 15:30:49:06
five minutes worth of 15:30:51:03
information into 40 and I 15:30:52:00
appreciate your patience. 15:30:53:18

But on behalf of the board of 15:30:55:18
directors chairman Flaherty, 15:30:57:12
beck ma and our individual and 15:31:00:27
business members I wish to thank 15:31:02:09
you for the opportunity to 15:31:03:24
provide testimony regarding 15:31:05:09
docket 0348, order for a hearing 15:31:07:00
regarding equity in the city of 15:31:09:12
Boston procurement and 15:31:11:09
purchasing. 15:31:13:00

I wish to also thank councilor 15:31:13:12
Michelle Wu and Kim Janey for 15:31:15:12

sponsoring the hearing order as 15:31:17:15
well as your continued advocacy 15:31:19:06
in this space. 15:31:20:21
Wayn't to thank councilor Flynn 15:31:21:15
for joining us as well as -- for 15:31:23:12
joining us earlier. 15:31:25:27
CAS. 15:31:27:03
>> I also want to thank chief 15:31:28:03
Barrows and Miller and 15:31:30:00
Ms. Williams and Mr. McFadden 15:31:33:18
for joining us today and the 15:31:35:09
information that they shared 15:31:36:12
earlier. 15:31:37:09
The mission of BECMA is advance 15:31:38:03
the well-being of black 15:31:41:21

businesses and organizations 15:31:43:24
that serve black community and 15:31:44:27
we seek to fulfill this mission 15:31:47:21
by have solutions oriented 15:31:49:18
solutions conversations 15:31:51:15
advocating for better practices 15:31:53:15
that will help grow and support 15:31:54:21
black businesses and black 15:31:56:27
workers and connecting our 15:31:57:27
business members to 15:31:59:03
opportunities in the public and 15:31:59:27
private sectors as well as to 15:32:01:21
one another. 15:32:03:06
Beck ma was founded in part to a 15:32:05:09
response to the federal reserve 15:32:06:24
bank of Boston's color in Boston 15:32:08:03
report and other similar reports 15:32:10:24
that signed a light on the ever 15:32:12:00
increasing gap between Boston 15:32:14:00
black and white residents and 15:32:17:06
addressed 22 tropes that have 15:32:18:24
proven detrimental to the growth 15:32:23:15
of black city here and across 15:32:25:09
the country, 13 percent of the 15:32:26:21
American population, 15:32:28:12
seven percent of the 15:32:29:09
commonwealth and 23 percent of 15:32:29:27
Boston's population to some we 15:32:32:03
apparently make up zero percent 15:32:33:18
of the business often because we 15:32:36:00
are told we can't be found and 15:32:38:00
with several hundred members of 15:32:39:27
beck ma some who are joining us 15:32:41:15
at the hearing now, in person 15:32:43:00
and online, along with our 600 15:32:44:15
plus certified black owned 15:32:47:15
businesses in the commonwealth 15:32:49:12
in the city and who just exist, 15:32:51:03

we are working to address this 15:32:53:15
lack of knowledge and would be 15:32:54:24
happy to share this list with 15:32:56:12
the city to further expand the 15:32:58:00
pool of MBEs. 15:32:59:24
When businesses are found, they 15:33:02:00
are told this second trope that 15:33:03:24
they are not capable of handling 15:33:07:06
contracts or automatically 15:33:09:00
barred from applications because 15:33:10:27
of strict requirements that shut 15:33:12:03
outgrowing enterprises and shut 15:33:13:21

off opportunity. 15:33:15:15
And with the presence of an end 15:33:16:12
partnership with the business 15:33:19:00
equity initiative of eastern 15:33:20:03
bank or the pay setter's 15:33:21:09
initiative at the Chamber of 15:33:22:21
Commerce or the Boston EUJIMA 15:33:23:09
project or INIC or Boston impact 15:33:27:15
initiative we are working to 15:33:29:24
stamp out the second notion and 15:33:31:00
prove that black businesses are, 15:33:32:15
in fact, ready for large scale 15:33:33:24
opportunities today and that 15:33:35:15
there are many more in the 15:33:37:09
pipeline to handle new 15:33:38:12
opportunities attorney. 15:33:39:24
And so as an advocate for lack 15:33:41:00
businesses and black workers, 15:33:42:15
opportunities to invest in local 15:33:44:12
businesses that are owned and 15:33:46:24
operated by huh-uhs and 15:33:48:09
ultimately employ us is a 15:33:50:15
primary concern for beck ma so I 15:33:51:21
am grateful for the chance to 15:33:53:18
address the committee on the 15:33:55:06
topic of equitable city 15:33:57:00
investment in these businesses. 15:33:58:21
So after reviewing the November, 15:33:59:27
we are grateful for the 15:34:02:24
information that was shared 15:34:03:18
today, but after reviewing the 15:34:05:09
November 2018 report, that was 15:34:06:21
produced by the office of 15:34:09:18
economic development, it was 15:34:10:21
clear to us that a monumental 15:34:11:18
effort was needed and much work 15:34:13:21
is left to be done in the city. 15:34:15:27
We found in that report that out 15:34:19:12
of at least according to the 15:34:23:12
numbers in the of this report 15:34:24:06
out of 14,000 contracts as 15:34:25:06

opposed to 5,000 offered today, 15:34:27:06
only .72 percent of that 15:34:29:24
spending went to minority 15:34:32:03
business enterprises. 15:34:33:15
A said another way which means 15:34:35:18
most of the city contracting 15:34:37:21
went to 99 percent, 15:34:38:27
99.26 percent of businesses of 15:34:40:21
noncolor which was alarming to 15:34:46:09

us and our members. 15:34:48:03
The city shared what the 15:34:48:27
challenges and barriers are to 15:34:50:12
increasing those numbers as well 15:34:51:18
as with they are trying to 15:34:52:24
address that. 15:34:54:09

I will say that a member of beck 15:34:54:27
ma Ellington Jackson will share 15:34:56:09
in later testimony what the 15:34:58:00
economic impact can be on 15:34:59:12
particularly the black community 15:35:02:15
if we don't ramp up efforts to 15:35:04:15
address city investment in 15:35:06:06
businesses of color. 15:35:08:12

I do here want to share 15:35:10:00
experiences, the experiences of 15:35:12:12
business owners that they have 15:35:13:21
had with the bidding process or 15:35:15:09
those who have avoided the 15:35:18:09
process altogether because of 15:35:19:18
the experiences of others and we 15:35:21:00
collected this information from 15:35:22:24
a survey sent out to our 15:35:24:03
membership. 15:35:25:15

And out of the many, many 15:35:26:06
responses that we received, we 15:35:28:09
received -- the results were the 15:35:30:03
following. 15:35:31:15

So 25 percent of those who 15:35:31:24
responded said that they had 15:35:33:06
applied for a city contract and 15:35:35:21
50 percent of those who did 15:35:37:15
apply said they had a very poor 15:35:38:24
experience with the process. 15:35:40:15
25 percent of them said that 15:35:42:09
they would not bid on a city 15:35:43:21
project again based on their 15:35:45:06
experience. 15:35:46:27

25 percent said that they 15:35:47:27
perceived the parameters for 15:35:50:00
MBEs to shift causing them to 15:35:53:03
not win the bid and only 15:35:55:09
25 percent of those who did 15:35:56:12
apply for a contract won the 15:35:59:00

actual bid. 15:36:01:09
I think that is reflected in the 15:36:02:06
numbers as well. 15:36:04:15
One member said specifically 15:36:05:06
their experience was mixed but 15:36:06:15
not great and found bids to be, 15:36:08:06

quote, cumbersome, expensive and 15:36:10:12
gored towards large companies 15:36:12:27
without thought for small local 15:36:14:06
companies who can do the job but 15:36:15:24
don't have the financial or 15:36:18:00
administrative capacity to 15:36:18:27
compete with the national 15:36:19:27
companies. 15:36:20:24

At beck marks we lauded the 15:36:22:00
passage of the promoting equity 15:36:23:18
and city of Boston contracting 15:36:25:09
ordinance that was sponsored by 15:36:27:06
councilor Michelle Wu and then 15:36:30:06
councilor and now Congress won 15:36:32:09
Ayanna Pressley but particularly 15:36:34:09
because of the reporting aspect 15:36:36:12
we believe then that it would 15:36:38:12
help us to better understand 15:36:39:18
where the problems lied and what 15:36:40:18
we as beck ma could do to offer 15:36:43:03
to address them. 15:36:46:06

We still believe it can be 15:36:46:27
helpful, this reporting feature 15:36:48:27
so long as future reports 15:36:50:24
include these following 15:36:52:18
recommendations, so a breakdown 15:36:54:00
of the MBE designation by racial 15:36:55:27
and ethnic categories, a 15:36:58:06
breakdown of the number of MBE 15:37:00:00
contracts by type, a breakdown 15:37:02:12
of the number of MBE contracts 15:37:04:12
by city department, a breakdown 15:37:06:06
of the number of NBEs by racial 15:37:08:06
and ethnic categories but 15:37:10:09
applied for contracts and were 15:37:12:03
denied said contracts, something 15:37:13:09
that was offered earlier as well 15:37:15:15
as in the report that is made 15:37:17:18
public, a list of the top few 15:37:20:15
reasons that MBEs did not 15:37:23:09
receive contracts and tale based 15:37:26:00
on one suggestion that was made 15:37:28:18
today from Councilor Wu or based 15:37:30:12
on her question it would be 15:37:32:09
great to also see how many 15:37:33:18
applied and were awarded or not 15:37:35:21
awarded multiyear contracts. 15:37:37:15

We do as beck ma acknowledged 15:37:40:18
the efforts of the of the mayor 15:37:42:15
and the office of economic 15:37:44:24

development and subdepartments 15:37:46:09
to increase their outreach 15:37:47:12
efforts as well as the recent 15:37:48:18
positive changes highlighted by 15:37:50:09
the initial report, particularly 15:37:51:15
the addition of equity and 15:37:53:18
inclusion language in city RFPs 15:37:55:03
and we are looking forward to 15:37:57:12
supporting this new policy in 15:37:58:21
many of the things that the 15:38:00:15
office of economic development 15:38:01:15
is working on with partners like 15:38:02:27
the black economic justice 15:38:05:06
institute and others to help it 15:38:06:21
reach its full potential. 15:38:08:06

And so based on the city 15:38:10:27
presentation today I am 15:38:14:06
interested in seeing the city's 15:38:15:06
effort continue trending in the 15:38:16:27
right direction, very positive 15:38:18:06
presentation that was presented 15:38:19:18
today, and we are looking 15:38:20:15
forward to working much more 15:38:22:09
closely with director Barrios 15:38:23:27
Milner, Ms. Williams and 15:38:26:03
Mr. McFadden on the efforts. 15:38:28:12
And so our members also gave 15:38:30:06
some recommendations on the same 15:38:31:27
survey for how we can increase 15:38:34:06
MBE participation in the 15:38:37:09
procurement process and those, 15:38:39:03
some of those recommendations 15:38:41:09
have been said already but being 15:38:42:18
the grand son of a pastor I have 15:38:43:24
no problem repeating what has 15:38:45:06
been said. 15:38:46:09

So goals have to be put in place 15:38:47:06
for MWBE participation. 15:38:49:00
It is our belief that this can 15:38:51:27
be done prior to the disparity 15:38:52:24
study and can be shifted after 15:38:54:21
its completion. 15:38:57:06

We would recommend at least 15:38:58:00
making one percent a goal since 15:38:59:06
we have not yet hit that. 15:39:01:15

Another recommendation was 15:39:03:24
providing individual quality 15:39:06:00
feedback with applicants as to 15:39:07:24
why a bid was not granted in 15:39:10:03
order to help them prepare for 15:39:11:12

the next time they seek to do -- 15:39:12:21
to seek a contract with the 15:39:15:12
city, larger contracts must be 15:39:17:03
broken up, the frame for 15:39:19:03
awareness and application 15:39:20:27
submission must be extended. 15:39:22:27
The city should partner with and 15:39:24:09
invest in existing technical 15:39:25:24
assistance programs, coupled 15:39:27:15
with the technical assistance 15:39:30:00
program it has itself. 15:39:31:12
The office of economic 15:39:33:06
development and its 15:39:34:15
subdepartments should expand 15:39:35:24
their partnerships with 15:39:37:00
community and business 15:39:37:27
organizations to increase the 15:39:38:24
number of business owners who 15:39:40:03
are made aware of all of the 15:39:41:18
resources and opportunities that 15:39:45:09
were shared with us today. 15:39:46:06
The city should set real spend 15:39:47:03
requirements for large national 15:39:49:27
and international bidders to 15:39:51:03
subcontract with small local 15:39:52:15
businesses of color. 15:39:53:27
The city should reduce the bond 15:39:54:21
requirement to a more realistic 15:39:56:18
rate based on the industry and, 15:39:59:24
one that was repeated often as 15:40:02:15
well is that the city should 15:40:04:00
ensure that businesses are paid 15:40:05:06
in a timely manner as 15:40:06:21
Mr. Beaster just referenced 15:40:08:00
earlier. 15:40:09:18
These were just a few of the 15:40:10:00
recommendations but in the 15:40:11:12
testimony I will? 15:40:13:03
It I will submit I a full 15:40:14:21
recommendations from all of our 15:40:16:18
members. 15:40:17:15
And so the November 2018 report 15:40:17:24
and the update we received today 15:40:20:12
tells us in short terms we have 15:40:22:06
a critical issue that must be 15:40:23:21
addressed with full urgency. 15:40:25:00
And if the city truly want to 15:40:26:21
achieve equity and decrease the 15:40:28:12
ever increasing wealth gap in 15:40:32:12
the city it must have all of 15:40:33:27

these recommendations and work 15:40:36:06
with beck ma and other 15:40:37:06

organizations working to 15:40:38:12
achieving the same if all do 15:40:39:21
their duty we will ensure the 15:40:41:24
production of a report in 2020 15:40:43:00
that shows we have made 15:40:45:06
considerable progress toward 15:40:46:15
true equity. 15:40:48:03

Thank you once more for hosting 15:40:49:03
this hearing on this important 15:40:50:21
topic and listening to our 15:40:52:00
concerns and I am looking 15:40:53:06
forward to the thoughtful 15:40:54:18
testimony of the, thoughtful 15:40:55:15
testimony of the public on this. 15:40:57:15
>> thank you. 15:40:59:15

>> And thank you for the work 15:41:00:09
you do as well as well as beck 15:41:01:24
ma does. 15:41:03:12

>> You raised a good point in 15:41:04:24
terms of invoices being paid. 15:41:07:18
This is probably a bad question 15:41:09:09
for chief barrow's team but do 15:41:10:24
we have an idea of the amount of 15:41:13:06
time invoices are out there for 15:41:14:27
the city? 15:41:17:12

>> I wouldn't have that, 15:41:18:15
councilor. 15:41:19:24

Mr. Chairman, I don't have any 15:41:22:03
direct involvement in that. 15:41:23:21

The times I was paid I got my 15:41:26:24
money timely so that was on a 15:41:28:06
personal note, but I think -- I 15:41:29:15
think just historically and 15:41:31:24
generally and I am sure chief 15:41:34:09
Barrows and this team can 15:41:35:24
respond to that, I would say 15:41:37:24
that most instances people are 15:41:39:09
paid beyond 90 days. 15:41:42:09

And that can be crippling to, 15:41:45:27
you know, a business. 15:41:47:24

>> Right. 15:41:48:12

>> And I would say 90 days is 15:41:48:27
probably on the early side. 15:41:52:09
But again, I don't want to 15:41:54:00
suggest or disparage because I 15:41:56:12
don't have specific facts, so -- 15:41:58:06
but that is a question that 15:42:00:18
needs to be answer ad. 15:42:01:15

>> That is a good point, I think 15:42:03:03
this committee should take kind 15:42:05:00
of a close look at that. 15:42:06:12
That's a critical piece in terms 15:42:07:21
of a company that has a contract 15:42:08:27

that submitted an invoice and 15:42:10:18
then they are having to carry 15:42:12:06
payroll and everything that is 15:42:13:27
associated with it for more than 15:42:15:24
90 days, it is a tall ask and it 15:42:17:12
would deter people quite frankly 15:42:19:27
from doing business with us if 15:42:21:24
they had to wait. 15:42:23:03
>> Well, I know that was a 15:42:24:12
circumstance, Mr. Chairman and 15:42:25:27
members that we saw on the 15:42:26:27
stateside and that was back 15:42:29:00
during that time. 15:42:30:12
So unless one has focused on 15:42:31:03
that particular issue I would 15:42:33:15
suspect it probably still exists 15:42:36:06
in the pro current process that 15:42:39:00
exists here in the city but 15:42:40:21
again that would be a question 15:42:42:09
to others other than I that can 15:42:43:09
answer that. 15:42:46:00
Okay. 15:42:46:18
And then you also talked about 15:42:46:27
trying to find a hook for the 15:42:48:03
professional services of 15:42:49:12
architects, engineers, and 15:42:50:12
attorneys, anything that comes 15:42:51:24
to mind as a reference to the D 15:42:52:27
and D model with chief FIRRO and 15:42:56:09
the Massport model but anything 15:42:59:12
other -- 15:43:01:15
>> well, again, I think, again, 15:43:02:00
I have to commend the city on, 15:43:03:27
and there are still things way 15:43:06:27
tonight speak, to because I want 15:43:08:12
to echo some of what SEGUND said 15:43:09:18
on this. 15:43:13:09
Any effort in terms of moving 15:43:14:06
the dial forward is something 15:43:16:09
that I will support in terms of 15:43:18:12
the -- what the council put 15:43:23:03
forward and the administration 15:43:25:15
is putting into play. 15:43:27:03
What we want to do is make it 15:43:28:18
more robust. 15:43:30:06

And to buttress and support that 15:43:31:00
particular effort. 15:43:33:09
So we are here in order to 15:43:33:27
support that. 15:43:35:18
On a professional side, I think 15:43:36:27
some of that also came out of 15:43:39:12
the D and D, you know, and the 15:43:41:03
community, because the community 15:43:44:06

was the one who got the DND and 15:43:45:09
councilor Janey knows that very, 15:43:48:24
very well having sat through all 15:43:50:24
of the meetings Roxbury, putting 15:43:53:06
together the one with third, 15:43:54:21
one-third, one-third which 15:43:55:15
encouraged that. 15:43:56:21
If you look at the team that 15:43:57:18
supported their -- there are 15:43:59:12
professional in terms of the 15:44:01:24
lawyers, the architects and 15:44:02:24
engineers in terms of color I 15:44:03:21
think what comes out of that, 15:44:05:15
when there is a wholistic 15:44:06:24
approach or there is an effort 15:44:08:12
by folks to address what they 15:44:11:06
feel will be a determining 15:44:15:03
factor in a very meaningful way, 15:44:16:06
so in and of itself, all the 15:44:18:12
boats get lift Mr. Chairman, so 15:44:20:18
within that, you may not -- but 15:44:22:27
then when the city is looking at 15:44:24:27
its numbers, they will then be 15:44:27:12
able to speak to the fact that 15:44:29:21
there are these professionals 15:44:30:27
that are involved in these -- on 15:44:32:03
the projects, particularly those 15:44:34:12
that are with the city. 15:44:35:21
But they can also apply that to 15:44:37:06
the private sector projects as 15:44:38:27
well. 15:44:40:21
>> Any questions for my 15:44:41:06
colleagues before we go to 15:44:43:00
public testimony? 15:44:44:06
>> The chair recognizes 15:44:45:00
Councilor Wu. 15:44:46:21
>> First I just wanted to that 15:44:47:09
was actually revised today the 15:44:57:00
number mentioned and it is 15:44:58:15
actually 55 percent when 15:45:00:15
compared against the actual 15:45:02:15
contract numbers so we have, 15:45:04:00

monumental work to pushing that 15:45:07:18
for even more. 15:45:10:18
I was curious when you described 15:45:14:12
feedback from membership in 15:45:15:24
terms of the process being 15:45:17:00
cumbersome and expensive, what 15:45:18:06
are the types of expenses that 15:45:19:27
arise in the bidding of -- in 15:45:23:21
bidding for these city 15:45:26:03
contracts? 15:45:27:12
>> 15:45:27:21

>> Good question. 15:45:28:06
We asked what the experience was 15:45:32:12
of members and what they shared 15:45:33:18
with us. 15:45:34:27
That's how they shared it with 15:45:35:18
us, but that is definitely 15:45:37:00
feedback I will ask the members 15:45:38:12
to provide. 15:45:39:15
>> I will give you, again, if 15:45:40:09
you are talking, in say a 15:45:41:27
developer promise, and you want 15:45:43:24
to do, feature an architect or 15:45:45:12
whatever, if you have to do 15:45:48:00
plans, the cost of doing the 15:45:50:09
plans would definitely -- a 15:45:53:15
development project I would say 15:45:56:21
most development projects 0 15:45:57:27
probably cost \$250,000 in order 15:45:59:18
to in order to submit in 15:46:01:21
response to the RFP. 15:46:03:21
And if you are, you know, a 15:46:06:09
small contractor, do you want to 15:46:08:03
invest \$250,000 on a hope and a 15:46:11:21
dream, that's one. 15:46:14:21
The other one is, I would 15:46:16:27
suspect on the contracts you 15:46:19:24
have for services, you still 15:46:20:27
have to have the time in which 15:46:23:09
to do it, and as chief Barrows 15:46:25:12
said, most of these companies 15:46:28:15
are in a position whereby they 15:46:29:24
have the persons who have the 15:46:31:24
skill set but they don't have 15:46:33:09
the time this which to be able 15:46:35:00
to -- in the back office to 15:46:37:06
respond to a 20 page application 15:46:39:24
which asks you to do the 15:46:44:03
financial pieces to get your 15:46:45:18
recommendations, to get your -- 15:46:47:21

you know, so that -- so that, I 15:46:50:09
would suspect, SEGUND are what 15:46:52:24
the members of beck ma are 15:46:56:27
referring to, not having a back 15:46:58:24
office. To me, I say one of the 15:46:59:27
ways in which to do that, if 15:47:01:09
technical assistance is there, 15:47:03:12
or 0 we begin to look at 15:47:05:18
entities that we can refer 15:47:07:27
persons to who can do that, sips 15:47:10:00
they can't hire them and 15:47:11:12
wouldn't want to hire them full 15:47:13:09
time that we have persons who 15:47:14:27
will provide the type of 15:47:16:06

assistance in terms of 15:47:18:06
responding to RFPs just like 15:47:19:18
people do for grant work. So I 15:47:21:18
think that might be a help to 15:47:26:00
some of the entities to get 15:47:27:15
persons who could do it. 15:47:29:09
I believe, and I wish and maybe 15:47:30:15
Stacy might know because she was 15:47:33:03
there with us with the enhanced 15:47:35:03
enterprise community, and the 15:47:36:18
office in terms of diversity, we 15:47:40:09
provide that type of technical 15:47:43:00
assistance to people assisting 15:47:45:21
them bidding, would by right 15:47:47:03
about that, Stacy, we were doing 15:47:49:03
that? 15:47:50:21
But in terms we would provide 15:47:51:03
them with some of the assistance 15:47:52:18
in responding to we have score 15:47:53:24
and others. 15:47:56:18
So I think we may have to put 15:47:57:03
that back in place, 0 Councilor 15:47:58:12
Wu. 15:47:59:15
>> Do you want to jump in on 15:48:00:21
something? 15:48:02:27
>> I signaled to Janey -- 15:48:04:12
>> You were kind 0 must have -- 15:48:06:24
>> I have something that is 15:48:08:09
actually great. 15:48:09:18
Something you are reading my 15:48:10:09
mind too. 15:48:12:09
[Laughter.] 15:48:12:27
>> He is not that had good. 15:48:13:09
>> In terms of, we talked a 15:48:16:27
little bit about the -- sorry, 15:48:18:09
what was described as the -- the 15:48:21:00

bind plan earlier of not just 15:48:25:18
knowing kind of retroactively 15:48:27:15
what contracts went out but a 15:48:30:03
look ahead in terms of multiyear 15:48:31:09
helping businesses plan out in 15:48:33:12
responding to multiyear 15:48:35:18
contracts. 15:48:37:00
Any advice for the city on to, 15:48:38:06
on how to better make those 15:48:41:27
connections and what format of 15:48:43:06
information would be helpful to 15:48:44:15
help people kind of map out when 15:48:46:06
they might be getting ready to 15:48:47:24
apply if we know that these type 15:48:50:06
of contracts are available every 15:48:52:18
three years and these types are 15:48:53:24
available every year, how do we 15:48:55:06

convey that information in a way 15:48:56:27
that actually connects with 15:48:58:15
people's plans? 15:48:59:18
>> Well, I think this is where 15:49:00:18
partnerships play a key role, so 15:49:02:15
I mean we have our membership of 15:49:04:15
X number of business members, 15:49:06:00
urban league has a number of 15:49:08:15
members in the NAACP, et cetera, 15:49:10:09
a and so you know for us it is 15:49:12:27
about making our members aware. 15:49:14:15
The piece here is lack of 15:49:16:24
information and awareness. 15:49:18:06
I think that was referenced in 15:49:19:12
the earlier presentation. 15:49:20:18
So I think through partnerships 15:49:23:09
where, you know, we are given 15:49:24:21
the information, we share it 15:49:26:09
with our members, that's the 15:49:27:15
most important piece of it. 15:49:29:03
And then we are better able to 15:49:30:18
identify as well how to help our 15:49:31:27
members in the process. 15:49:33:18
>> And then the last batch of 15:49:36:09
questions I had for everyone and 15:49:39:06
hopefully including the chief as 15:49:41:03
well, is just a little, pushing 15:49:42:18
a little further on the 30 B 15:49:44:18
conversation from earlier, my 15:49:46:21
understanding is that the 15:49:48:18
threshold actually went up in 15:49:49:21
some cases. 15:49:52:09
I forget what years, but I 15:49:53:00

thought it was very recently, 15:49:54:18
maybe 2016 in the mist of 15:49:58:00
when -- when councilor Pressley 15:49:59:27
and I were talking about this 15:50:01:27
ordinance that, in fact, there 15:50:03:09
is a lot more discretion for 15:50:06:03
department heads who are signing 15:50:08:15
contracts now, not even up to 15:50:10:15
35,000 but anything, 50,000 and 15:50:12:21
below, they have a certain level 15:50:15:24
of discretion, and then even 15:50:17:03
above 50,000 you can do a sealed 15:50:19:00
bid that takes into account not 15:50:21:00
just the lowest bidder but other 15:50:22:15
factors as long as they are kind 15:50:24:15
of written in advance and 15:50:25:15
provided. 15:50:26:21
Is that understanding correct 15:50:27:00
that we actually do have -- it 15:50:28:18
is not just kind of straight 15:50:30:09

lowest bid in that -- at this 15:50:32:09
level? 15:50:35:00
>> Yes. 15:50:36:06
I think -- you are absolutely 15:50:36:18
right. 15:50:38:12
There was adjustments made and 15:50:38:21
numbers increased that can get 15:50:41:03
back to the real numbers but 15:50:43:03
when you are looking at, when 15:50:44:03
you look at some of the contract 15:50:45:21
for construction, which is where 15:50:47:24
we have some of our larger 15:50:49:18
dollars and larger number of 15:50:51:12
bids, we really need to shift 15:50:52:21
the dial, you don't have that 15:50:54:12
kind of discretion. 15:50:56:18
And that's a problem. 15:50:57:18
We would love to work with the 15:50:58:18
council to begin to address 15:50:59:24
that. 15:51:01:09
>> Okay. 15:51:03:03
Okay. 15:51:05:09
I guess I need a little more 15:51:05:18
detail on what sort of 15:51:06:27
flexibility is missing, because 15:51:08:24
it seems that for example, 15:51:10:27
entities like Massport have been 15:51:12:12
able to work very well within 15:51:14:06
with the current framework in 15:51:16:06
order to achieve success and 15:51:20:00

building in the right criteria 15:51:23:09
so that they have seen more 15:51:25:09
inclusionary spending, even 15:51:28:21
without legal change. 15:51:30:24
>> So we, in fact, adopted month 15:51:31:21
ago, Massport language, and so 15:51:34:18
there are seven criteria we are 15:51:36:09
looking for diversity in land 15:51:38:03
disposition now. 15:51:39:21
We are looking Ford for the 15:51:43:15
legal team to be diverse. 15:51:44:24
We are looking for is 15:51:46:03
architectural team to show 15:51:48:24
diversity. 15:51:50:09
Ownership, ownership 15:51:51:12
participation. 15:51:53:15
With we are looking for the 15:51:54:18
developer. 15:51:57:09
We are looking for GC. 15:51:57:27
And I am forgetting the other 15:52:03:09
couple of criteria and get that 15:52:05:27
wording for you but it is the 15:52:07:12
same seven criteria that 15:52:08:18

Massport put out. 15:52:10:00
We adopted and we are scoring 15:52:11:21
and putting in there clearly two 15:52:17:00
different things. 15:52:19:09
On the front end, if you don't 15:52:20:06
supervisor ploy that 15:52:22:15
information, you are 15:52:23:03
disqualified. 15:52:24:03
So everybody supplies that 15:52:25:09
information. 15:52:26:24
On the back end, we are using it 15:52:27:03
to weigh who is getting 15:52:29:15
selected. 15:52:30:18
And so, in fact, we have adopted 15:52:32:06
and learned from Massport and 15:52:35:27
you are absolutely correct. 15:52:37:15
There are some things we can do 15:52:38:12
that don't need to change the 15:52:39:12
laws and we are trying to do 15:52:40:24
that. 15:52:43:00
>> And councilor, if I might 15:52:43:09
just underscore that, because 15:52:45:24
that a came from a process which 15:52:48:15
the state had gone to a number 15:52:50:09
of years ago on its committees 15:52:52:12
trying to to begin to address 15:52:55:06
that and what that allows us to 15:52:57:18

do, the disparity study doesn't 15:52:59:21
even come into the conversation. 15:53:01:24
This is a selection criteria 15:53:03:00
that just says it is good 15:53:05:18
business and if you want this 15:53:06:21
business, these are the things 15:53:07:24
that you need to do and I can 15:53:09:21
tell you 0 when that is in place 15:53:11:06
opportunities present 15:53:16:24
themselves. 15:53:17:21
When that is not in place we 15:53:18:15
have the seaport. 15:53:19:12
So that is what happens. 15:53:20:09
And so, again, these are some of 15:53:22:21
the things which will allow us 15:53:24:09
to do, you get to building gas, 15:53:25:21
you get their joint ventures, 15:53:28:12
they happen naturally. 15:53:29:27
>> . 15:53:30:18
I do want to draw a contrast for 15:53:33:27
there to be a conversation, when 15:53:35:21
you have other bidding process 15:53:36:18
like honesty assets, like the 15:53:40:15
library, where it is a blind 15:53:42:27
bid, there is not a lot of 15:53:46:15
creativity, and when you have 15:53:49:09

perhaps, and this is the thing 15:53:52:03
that bothers me the most, a bad 15:53:54:12
actor who is not following city 15:53:58:27
regulations for BRAP, for 15:54:01:15
instance we cannot consider that 15:54:03:09
when we are selecting the 15:54:04:18
contractor in that case, so I 15:54:06:21
just envied the council to work 15:54:09:03
with us and have a further 15:54:11:15
conversation on 30 B and 15:54:12:24
understanding this so we can 15:54:14:12
bring some folks down and really 15:54:15:09
dive deep and see what we can do 15:54:16:24
together to address that. 15:54:18:18
>> Great. 15:54:19:21
Thank you. 15:54:20:27
>> We have been joined by 15:54:21:03
councilor Lydia Edwards. 15:54:23:18
The question recognize 15:54:25:06
councilperson Kim Janey. 15:54:29:03
>> I think it is important that 15:54:31:03
we use the current tools that we 15:54:32:18
have, I want to echo council 15:54:34:00
lady Wu. 15:54:36:15

>> As far as pushing there and 15:54:38:03
encouraging or insisting we get 15:54:40:21
diversity without changing. 15:54:43:18
I am happy to have the 15:54:44:24
conversation about whether we 15:54:46:00
need change and work with you to 15:54:47:03
change 30 B, but I think we do 15:54:48:15
have more discretion in terms of 15:54:51:06
requiring diversity in 15:54:54:06
encouraging that. 15:54:58:18
So I think it is and/or both. 15:55:00:00
I don't want to put off to the 15:55:02:21
future we have to do 30 B first 15:55:04:00
or we can't change anything. 15:55:06:03
I want to be working for this 15:55:07:21
panel, I want to thank you for 15:55:09:03
your amazing presentation, your 15:55:11:09
leadership, your engagement on 15:55:13:12
these very important issues. 15:55:15:00
I am very interested in the 15:55:17:06
survey results if those can be 15:55:19:18
shared if that is something you 15:55:23:03
can share with us that would be 15:55:24:06
helpful. 15:55:25:24
>> Uh-huh. 15:55:26:06
>> As well as the 15:55:26:15
recommendations as you had for 15:55:28:03
us, that would be helpful. 15:55:29:15
And thank you for joining us and 15:55:30:21

for staying, Chief Barrows. 15:55:32:00
I did want to come back to the 15:55:34:00
size of contracts. 15:55:36:24
There is a business minority 15:55:38:06
owned business in my district 15:55:41:27
that does good work, and is 15:55:44:15
unable to really compete on some 15:55:46:18
of the -- this is a food service 15:55:48:18
company, particularly in our 15:55:51:03
schools, because the way the RFP 15:55:53:12
is written, it is really written 15:55:55:18
toward large companies, and it 15:55:57:18
is not something that this 15:56:00:06
particular PBE can then get 15:56:01:27
their foot in the door. 15:56:04:09
So if you could just speak to -- 15:56:05:15
we heard both panelists here 15:56:07:03
mention the size of contracts. 15:56:08:27
It is something I mentioned in 15:56:10:09
previous hearings. 15:56:11:18
Could you talk about what your 15:56:12:06

office is doing to break -- 15:56:14:09
because that's another tool I 15:56:15:27
think that we can do now without 15:56:17:06
waiting to change, you know, 15:56:19:12
state law or any other kind of 15:56:21:03
law. 15:56:22:12
>> Yes. 15:56:22:18
No. 15:56:23:21
I wholeheartedly agree. 15:56:25:00
There are things we can do now 15:56:26:18
or are trying to do now, more 15:56:28:03
things to be done. 15:56:29:24
There are, however, things that 15:56:32:18
encourage us to have 15:56:35:06
conversations about that, look 15:56:36:03
at the legal parameters we work 15:56:37:21
in and I do think that the 15:56:40:12
disparity study speaks to a 15:56:41:18
whole set of other things that 15:56:42:27
we have to do as government that 15:56:44:03
is really important. 15:56:46:18
So I think I think together the 15:56:47:09
set of tools allow us to move 15:56:50:03
the needle, and without a 15:56:51:18
comprehensive approach we would 15:56:54:03
be hampered in other places we 15:56:56:06
shouldn't be. 15:56:58:12
To the size of contracts, that 15:56:58:27
is one of the -- that's one of 15:57:01:03
the practices that are really 15:57:03:00
important and so director 15:57:04:12
Barrows new than and her team 15:57:07:03

are meeting, actively meeting 15:57:08:21
with the department to look at 15:57:10:21
the size of contracts and 15:57:11:21
understand the opportunities 15:57:13:24
which is why we use the example 15:57:15:15
of the land exchange company and 15:57:17:12
then we also used the example of 15:57:22:09
the recycling carts so that was 15:57:24:12
broken out because we felt it 15:57:26:24
was an opportunity there as a 15:57:28:00
city to provide an opportunity 15:57:30:12
that typically is bundled, and 15:57:32:12
so in the food contract, that is 15:57:34:18
a conversation that has been had 15:57:37:06
I would love to give you the 15:57:42:12
business and get you intel. 15:57:43:27
It is very important to 15:57:45:09
understand whether there is an 15:57:46:24

opportunity for someone to apply 15:57:49:06
or not. 15:57:50:12

So we can focus our energy. 15:57:51:15
I think that would be really 15:57:53:00
helpful. 15:57:54:06

And so when you say that 15:57:54:21
internally there are 15:57:56:27
conversations happening, what is 15:57:57:24
the end result of those 15:58:00:03
conversations? 15:58:01:21

Are there some -- 15:58:02:12
>> the recycling cart would be 15:58:03:21
one. 15:58:05:09

>> I got those. 15:58:05:12

>> Two. 15:58:06:24

>> Are there recommendations for 15:58:07:06
other industries? 15:58:08:09

>> Yes. 15:58:10:00

>> Okay. 15:58:10:12

Is food service one in terms of 15:58:11:03
our schools? 15:58:12:15

>> the food -- I will get you -- 15:58:13:00

I would love the to -- I know 15:58:15:06

conversation has been started 15:58:17:00

because I have had those 15:58:18:00

conversations with BPS and get 15:58:18:27

you an update on where that is. 15:58:20:21

>> That would be helpful and 15:58:22:18

thank you again for staying and 15:58:23:27

thank you again to this panel. 15:58:25:12

For all of your work. 15:58:27:18

Thank you. 15:58:28:27

>> Thank you councilor Janey 15:58:29:06

orcs the chair recognizes 15:58:30:21

councilor Ed Flynn. 15:58:32:24

>> Thank you councilor, council 15:58:33:18
Flaherty and thank you to the 15:58:35:27
panelists for your great work so 15:58:37:06
many, for so many years and to 15:58:38:27
chief Barrows as well for -- for 15:58:40:27
your work. 15:58:44:09

I just had maybe a comment and a 15:58:45:18
question. 15:58:47:15

Several months ago I was at a 15:58:49:03
minority owned business in my 15:58:53:03
district on Tyler street in 15:58:55:09
downtown Boston, Chinatown. 15:58:59:03
And the owner raised his rent on 15:59:01:12
his hair salon and we were able 15:59:07:03
to work closely with the Chinese 15:59:08:15

progressive association, with 15:59:11:06
the community and finally the 15:59:12:06
landlord was being reasonable, 15:59:16:15
but what can we do in terms of 15:59:18:00
helping already small business 15:59:23:00
owners, minority owned small 15:59:24:03
businesses, women owned 15:59:26:15
businesses, you know, they have 15:59:28:21
been in this city for 20, 30 15:59:30:00
years, during lean types, 15:59:31:21
difficult times and now the 15:59:34:15
economy is booming and the rent 15:59:35:27
are going up and, you know, what 15:59:37:09
are we going to do for them? 15:59:41:15
How are we going to save their 15:59:42:27
small business if they provide a 15:59:46:06
great service for the community 15:59:47:27
as well? 15:59:48:24

When I was working with this 15:59:49:12
small businessman in Chinatown, 15:59:52:09
I saw this elderly woman that 15:59:53:27
has had no money literally going 15:59:57:00
in \$2 to help to pay for this 15:59:59:12
guy's legal bills so he would 16:00:01:18
have legal representation in 16:00:04:06
court during this eviction 16:00:06:27
process. 16:00:08:06

But I think we are better than 16:00:08:15
that. 16:00:10:00

I think we need to work hard or 16:00:10:09
work closer, work smarter to 16:00:13:12
make sure that small businesses 16:00:15:03
that really have provided so 16:00:17:18
much services to our city, to 16:00:19:09
our neighborhoods, I think we 16:00:22:00
can do a better job in keeping 16:00:24:21
them in business. 16:00:28:03

And I think we owe it to them, 16:00:29:18

woman owned companies, minority 16:00:32:00
owned companies, and, you know, 16:00:33:24
we have these great companies in 16:00:35:24
downtown Boston and for Michelle 16:00:38:00
Wu district and maybe there is a 16:00:40:21
role for the great companies to 16:00:43:03
play in this debate as well, to 16:00:44:09
make sure we keep our small 16:00:46:21
businesses in the city. 16:00:48:00
I just want to see what your 16:00:51:27
comments might be on that. 16:00:53:06
>> Well, councilor, I mean, you 16:00:54:27

have touched the hot button 16:01:02:06
issue and I think that if I was 16:01:05:03
to look at it from being one who 16:01:07:15
represents developers, I would 16:01:10:06
say that what we can begin to 16:01:12:09
look at is, one, looking at the 16:01:14:24
affordability question, not only 16:01:19:15
in our residential component but 16:01:21:00
also in our retail and 16:01:23:27
commercial spaces as well. 16:01:26:15
We would be talking about as 16:01:28:27
things -- as -- as properties 16:01:31:03
come online that have a 16:01:34:03
commercial component, maybe we 16:01:36:21
are talking about the sizes of 16:01:38:00
unit that we can have, which 16:01:40:18
will service the types of 16:01:42:12
businesses, because I don't 16:01:44:09
think you are going to be able, 16:01:45:24
the way the booming market is 16:01:50:03
going in Boston and the way I 16:01:51:15
said earlier about seaport as an 16:01:53:06
example, where most folks, most 16:01:54:21
of those small businesses you 16:01:56:06
are talking about would even 16:01:57:18
have an opportunity to be able 16:01:58:18
to rent there, because of what 16:01:59:12
to the cost per foot is. 16:02:03:09
0 is so it is somewhat of a 16:02:06:21
policy piece and somewhat of 16:02:08:18
looking at it, but I think it is 16:02:09:24
going to warrant further 16:02:12:00
discussion on how you can 16:02:13:03
accomplish that, and you are not 16:02:14:00
going to be able to accomplish 16:02:16:06
it on a case-by-case eviction 16:02:17:03
process. 16:02:19:18
I mean you may have saved this 16:02:19:27
person for now if that person 16:02:22:12
has been saved but that's not 16:02:23:27
going to be a long-term solution 16:02:25:03

for that individual, because 16:02:28:03
those rents are going to 16:02:29:06
continue to grow unless you have 16:02:30:09
been able to work out a 16:02:31:18
particular deal. 16:02:34:27
So I think it is a longer 16:02:35:18
conversation, councilor Flynn, 16:02:36:21
in order to address it, but I 16:02:39:00
think some of the things is, 16:02:40:12

maybe we need look at how we 16:02:41:15
look at affordability and 16:02:42:27
commercial, in commercial places 16:02:44:21
as well as a start. 16:02:46:27

>> Thank you. 16:02:47:21

I think those are excellent 16:02:48:06
comments and it is not the best 16:02:49:12
thing for me to say but I would 16:02:51:15
say I would support a tax on 16:02:53:03
these wealthy businesses in our 16:02:54:21
city and having that stream of 16:02:56:15
tax go to the small businesses 16:02:59:09
that are already in our city 16:03:01:27
because once we start losing 16:03:03:27
those type of small businesses 16:03:06:00
you really lose the heart and 16:03:07:06
soul of Boston so I am pretty 16:03:09:09
frustrated about it. 16:03:10:18

And councilor, just to add to 16:03:13:00
what Mr. Feaster said, first I 16:03:15:06
appreciate you bringing up that 16:03:17:21
issue because I know for many of 16:03:19:21
our members rent is an 16:03:21:15
increasing burden on them, so, 16:03:24:03
you know, I know for BECMA I 16:03:25:21
wouldn't be able to say right 16:03:28:12
now what our primary response to 16:03:29:24
that would be but I know this 16:03:33:15
August body is taking up a lot 16:03:35:24
of matters related to rents as 16:03:38:00
well and thinking about that so 16:03:39:27
I know BECMA would be pretty 16:03:41:18
much committed to working with 16:03:43:21
yourself and your colleagues on 16:03:45:18
addressing that issue. 16:03:47:00

>> Thank you and I just want to 16:03:48:00
thank my colleagues councilor 16:03:49:24
Janey, Wu, Edwards and Flaherty 16:03:51:15
and the panelists and chief 16:03:54:03
Barrows for doing everything you 16:03:55:24
do, to provide a level playing 16:03:57:24
field for everybody, so we 16:04:00:27
appreciate what you are doing. 16:04:02:27
Thank you. 16:04:04:15

>> Thank you, young man. 16:04:05:06
The chair recognizes councilor 16:04:07:00
Edwards. 16:04:08:15
>> -- have to do with our future 16:04:10:21
of Boston is ensuring we have 16:04:20:18
actual businesses that are run 16:04:22:21

by Bostonians and people of 16:04:24:06
color, because we are such a 16:04:25:12
huge consumers of the city, we 16:04:27:24
will drive the market, and we 16:04:29:27
can create or we can destroy 16:04:31:24
one. 16:04:33:21
And so thank you so much for 16:04:34:00
coming to testify -- 16:04:35:12
>> How the market can be driven 16:04:42:03
through zoning and I don't know 16:04:44:00
if you thoughts or if you had 16:04:45:09
some ideas, there are two ways 16:04:47:06
in which I was hoping to 16:04:48:21
following up on councilor 16:04:50:00
Flynn's ideas for looking at 16:04:51:12
ways in which commercial space, 16:04:53:00
but we already have an IDEP for 16:04:54:24
housing units is there a 16:04:58:18
possibility we could think of an 16:04:59:18
IDEF program for affordable 16:05:01:06
commercial units? 16:05:03:03
As we build out large commercial 16:05:04:15
spaces so ensuring that when the 16:05:06:18
-- another seaport or another 16:05:10:21
opportunity or Suffolk downs is 16:05:12:06
built there is a certain 16:05:13:27
percentage that is required for 16:05:17:00
affordable local businesses and 16:05:19:06
small businesses and that's one 16:05:21:03
suggestion and I would love your 16:05:22:12
thoughts on that and the other 16:05:23:12
suggestion I have is with 16:05:24:15
regards to in general two -- the 16:05:25:12
PDA process, we are going into 16:05:29:00
for Suffolk downs, expected to 16:05:31:06
build about 10,000 housing 16:05:33:06
units, it is going to be mixed 16:05:34:21
use. 16:05:36:24
It is the single largest 16:05:37:03
development in Boston's history 16:05:38:09
for -- in five phases over 20 16:05:41:15
years. 16:05:43:21
And one of the commitment Jess 16:05:44:12
as mitigation is that certain 16:05:46:27
percentage of the commercial 16:05:50:00
space will be given to local 16:05:51:03
folks which I stay good form of 16:05:52:06

mitigation but I think it should 16:05:54:18
be not as a give but as a 16:05:56:03
requirement for building such 16:05:57:24

massive amount office space in 16:06:00:00
our Boston -- in Boston. 16:06:02:09
So I am just curious on your 16:06:03:18
thoughts in making sure our 16:06:06:06
MBEW, WBE components and 16:06:07:15
requirements are a part of 16:06:11:06
stoning generally, especially 16:06:12:27
when we are looking at that, and 16:06:14:03
then also maybe an a IDEP 16:06:15:06
program like for local 16:06:17:27
businesses. 16:06:19:09

>> Well, thank you, councilor 16:06:21:06
Edwards. 16:06:22:27

I was allowing to that without 16:06:23:15
-- without the specificity. 16:06:25:09

>> Oh. 16:06:27:12

>> When I was saying about, you 16:06:28:00
know, we have it in the 16:06:30:09
residential piece so you hit it 16:06:31:21
right on the head. 16:06:33:15

For full disclosure I sat on the 16:06:37:24
board of appeals here in the 16:06:39:21
city of Boston and that's my 16:06:40:27
practice is zoning. 16:06:42:24

>> What I would say, it goes to 16:06:45:21
the same process we referred to 16:06:47:27
earlier that chief Barrows and 16:06:50:18
others have spoken about. 16:06:53:12

If it is in the requirements it 16:06:55:15
is going to be followed. 16:06:57:18

>> Yes. 16:06:58:27

>> I mean, it is just that 16:06:59:09
simple, and government has to 16:07:01:15
play a role in it. 16:07:03:24

If you are in the decision 16:07:05:03
making process or you are the 16:07:06:15
landowner or you are in control 16:07:07:18
of how the process is going to 16:07:09:21
be run as I noted in what you 16:07:10:21
have been doing as far as the 16:07:12:27
Suffolk downs -- and I applaud 16:07:14:15
you on that, then that is when 16:07:17:24
you have to put it in. 16:07:20:06

The other thing I would say -- 16:07:21:21
no you don't want it to be a 16:07:23:06
gift. 16:07:25:27

What you want to do is to 16:07:26:06
determine what is the 16:07:27:21
feasibility of the types of 16:07:29:12
rents that one can pay for the 16:07:31:12

types of spaces that would be 16:07:33:12
afforded to them and then to 16:07:37:03
work it out within the pro forma 16:07:39:00
with the developer so that you 16:07:41:21
have long-term sustainability. 16:07:43:06
Because what we don't want to 16:07:47:21
happen is what is happening in 16:07:48:27
the housing world, expiring uses 16:07:50:15
and then you have got to come 16:07:53:03
back 20 years later and one says 16:07:54:15
okay the affordability is gone, 16:07:57:21
now you are paying \$100 a square 16:07:59:12
foot, and what council fin was 16:08:01:27
referring to, those persons are 16:08:07:00
gone. 16:08:08:09
I know oftentimes, even in my 16:08:08:27
own experiences we think about 16:08:10:21
the now but if we have to think 16:08:12:03
longer down the road, to what 16:08:15:21
may happen in the future, so I 16:08:17:06
think as a starting point, yes, 16:08:18:18
to answer your question more 16:08:20:27
directly, at least from my 16:08:22:03
perspective, zoning, if you 16:08:23:21
change or put the requirements 16:08:25:09
into zoning, then you have a 16:08:27:00
hold on the process, a, and you 16:08:31:09
can influence how that is 16:08:34:15
handled so I would say 16:08:36:18
definitely if it is in the 16:08:37:21
stoning, in the regulations, in 16:08:39:03
the requirements, IDP for 16:08:40:15
commercial, however one wants to 16:08:42:09
coin it, if you put it there as 16:08:43:27
a requirement I think you will 16:08:46:24
get a better result just 16:08:48:24
assaying oh I just want to be a 16:08:50:24
good developer in order to do 16:08:53:15
it. 16:08:54:21
So we had actually Councilor Wu 16:08:57:09
and I had proposed I think it 16:09:01:00
was a formula or business -- a 16:09:02:21
proposed ordinance on that that 16:09:06:18
we might consider bringing back 16:09:08:03
up again and really doing the 16:09:09:12
big box stores coming into 16:09:11:12
Boston and how to make sure that 16:09:13:00
as they are coming in they are 16:09:16:00
either the best neighbors we can 16:09:17:27
have or that we make sure that 16:09:19:06

because they can compete so 16:09:21:06
quickly and with with the 16:09:23:09

massive amount of resources they 16:09:25:09
tend to bowl over local 16:09:27:18
businesses so certain resistance 16:09:30:18
you cannot in zoning favor local 16:09:34:03
business over, I don't know, 16:09:37:03
large box stores and there are 16:09:38:27
some case law also cited. 16:09:41:00
So one of the things I would 16:09:43:18
love to work with you on is 16:09:44:24
making sure that we can get over 16:09:46:03
that hump legally, and either 16:09:47:15
put in somehow the MBEWBE 16:09:50:03
directly into stoning that 16:09:53:15
doesn't hit up against this 16:09:54:09
local preference and then 16:09:56:18
possibly be, possibly cause any 16:09:58:06
stoning change to be legally 16:10:01:09
challenged. 16:10:02:21
0 so I am really interested in 16:10:03:09
trying to figure out how this 16:10:05:27
could work in terms of stoning 16:10:08:06
but waited to put that out that 16:10:09:06
a too that we tried and met with 16:10:11:09
some legal resistance so we are 16:10:12:27
trying to go back to the table 16:10:14:24
to figure this out so we will 16:10:16:00
work to figure it out, 16:10:17:12
ultimately. 16:10:18:24
>> Thank you, councilor Edwards. 16:10:20:18
And thank you to Joe for being 16:10:22:06
here and participating and for 16:10:24:03
adding some insight and look 16:10:26:12
forward to continued 16:10:28:00
partnership, to counsel with you 16:10:29:09
as we continue to try to -- 16:10:31:21
>> chairmen, members thank you 16:10:33:18
very much for the invitation. 16:10:35:03
>> Thank you. 16:10:36:09
And I know we are over our 5:00 16:10:36:24
o'clock time slot but I know we 16:10:38:12
have several folks that have 16:10:40:18
signed in to offer public 16:10:41:15
testimony. 16:10:43:03
And the public testimony podiums 16:10:44:00
are right to my left and right. 16:10:46:15
I have 0 Robert Newton, 16:10:48:21
Priscilla flint, Karl, looks 16:10:50:27
like curb -- thank you and 16:10:54:09

Martin Evans. 16:10:58:24
And just -- either way one for 16:11:00:09
one. 16:11:03:06
So Robert Newton you have been 16:11:03:15
patiently waiting and you signed 16:11:05:15

in first so in order of business 16:11:06:24
you have the microphone. 16:11:08:27
Just state your name and 16:11:10:00
affiliation for the record. 16:11:10:24
>> Okay, my name is Robert -- 16:11:11:18
Michigan pipe he name is Robert 16:11:22:03
A. Newton I am a tax accountant 16:11:23:12
and the reason I am here is 16:11:25:27
because I got clients like small 16:11:27:00
business clients that I help get 16:11:28:27
certified like 8-A a -- 0 so I 16:11:31:09
want to come here and get more 16:11:36:12
information and one of the 16:11:37:21
things I listened to people 16:11:39:27
talking about all of the 16:11:41:21
paperwork and compliance that 16:11:42:21
small businesses have to deal 16:11:44:18
with and I say wow, you are 16:11:45:18
going to have to get certified 16:11:47:15
in the city of Boston to do 16:11:48:21
business in the city of Boston, 16:11:50:18
along with the 8-A, HUD zone 16:11:52:12
certification and 16:11:55:00
certifications. You know, that 16:11:57:03
is a lot of paperwork, so I just 16:11:59:00
want to figure that out. 16:12:02:09
Because that sounds kind of 16:12:04:06
important, to the clients I 16:12:05:21
have, normally the type of guys 16:12:06:21
that just go out there that do a 16:12:10:03
good job working but when it 16:12:11:24
comes to dealing with all of 16:12:13:00
these different compliance and 16:12:13:27
paperwork they do have a problem 16:12:15:00
with it and so I try to take the 16:12:16:03
case and make sure they do this 16:12:19:09
and that and do it on a timely 16:12:20:18
burglary. 16:12:23:18
It is kind of important. 16:12:23:27
>> So you are suggesting 16:12:25:15
streamlining the paperwork. 16:12:26:24
>> That would make sense and be 16:12:27:21
helpful, especially for small 16:12:29:12
businesses. 16:12:30:24
Because you get certified here, 16:12:31:18

certified her, certified here, 16:12:34:12
there is a lot of paperwork a 16:12:36:00
lot. 16:12:37:15
Thank you for your kind words 16:12:37:27
about my mom. 16:12:39:27
>> Thank you, I app appreciate 16:12:40:12
it. 16:12:42:06
>> Priscilla banks I think has 16:12:42:09

left the building. 16:12:44:12
Karl, you are up. 16:12:45:12
Welcome. 16:12:46:27
Please state your name and a 16:12:47:12
affiliation for the record. 16:12:48:09
>> Good afternoon. 16:12:50:00
>> Good afternoon. 16:12:51:09
>> okay. 16:12:51:21
I guess I won't have a 16:12:53:00
microphone. 16:12:53:27
>> You have it, the just going 16:12:54:06
to click on as you start to 16:12:55:12
talk. 16:12:56:24
>> Good afternoon. 16:12:57:00
My name is Karl QUAKOO and for 16:12:57:18
the Massachusetts minority 16:13:01:21
contractors association. 16:13:03:12
I would first first like to 16:13:04:15
thank city councilors for making 16:13:06:15
the time to schedule this 16:13:07:27
presentation. 16:13:08:27
The schedule to public hearings 16:13:10:27
to hear directly from the 16:13:12:27
minority construction 16:13:14:06
contractors, vendors and 16:13:15:15
professional services firm. 16:13:16:27
About how the lack of access to 16:13:19:00
to opportunity in the city 16:13:21:06
contracts negatively impact 16:13:22:24
minority business growth, 16:13:25:03
financial sustainability and 16:13:26:18
capacity building. 16:13:28:24
It was encouraging to hear the 16:13:31:09
city's report of how things are 16:13:33:12
trending in a positive 16:13:35:18
direction. 16:13:36:24
It was encouraging to hear the 16:13:37:27
city offer technical support to 16:13:39:24
the small businesses and it was 16:13:41:21
encouraging to hear the city had 16:13:44:24
dealt, delved into the reasons 16:13:47:09
why MBE participation has fallen 16:13:49:09
off. 16:13:52:12
It was also very encouraging to 16:13:53:09
hear the in-depth questions and 16:13:54:21
positive recommendations by the 16:13:56:24
city councilors. 16:13:58:12
0 we are here today to state in 16:14:02:12
the strongest manner possible 16:14:05:06
that the testimony provided at 16:14:08:03
this hearing not be an exercise 16:14:09:21
in futility. 16:14:13:06
Instead, MCA urges you to 16:14:14:24

continue your strong advocacy 16:14:17:27
for those of us who ply our 16:14:20:00
trade, struggle to keep our 16:14:23:06
doors open and serve as a 16:14:24:21
primary source of jobs and 16:14:26:12
business opportunities for 16:14:28:09
minorities in the construction 16:14:29:15
trade and professional services 16:14:31:03
industry despite the many 16:14:32:18
obstacles we face every day. 16:14:34:15
>> The contract opportunities 16:14:36:18
with the city should be an 16:14:39:24
accessible, renewable and 16:14:43:00
expandable resource. 16:14:44:21
A statement until the growth 16:14:46:15
plan of these businesses and not 16:14:47:24
the elusive and intangibles they 16:14:49:12
have been today. 16:14:52:12
And MCA pledges to work with you 16:14:53:21
in the demanding that current 16:14:58:06
city administration develop a 16:14:59:27
comprehensive access to 16:15:01:09
opportunity, policy, and 16:15:03:15
programs that mirrors and 16:15:05:09
embraces the diversity of the 16:15:07:12
city. 16:15:09:06
>> The integrity and credibility 16:15:09:12
of the city's, city of Boston 16:15:12:24
diversity and inclusion program 16:15:14:27
can only be sustained if 16:15:16:09
minority businesses utilize and 16:15:19:00
contract -- utilization and 16:15:21:06
contract awards are monitored 16:15:24:27
and compiled through data. 16:15:26:18
More importantly, the program 16:15:29:00
should include inherent benefits 16:15:30:21
to businesses who demonstrate a 16:15:32:21
practice of inclusion to ensure 16:15:35:18
the consistent achievement of a 16:15:38:06

level of economic parity and 16:15:40:06
opportunity to reflect a strong, 16:15:42:03
unwavering commitment by the 16:15:44:12
city to access an opportunity. 16:15:46:12
>> Even though city is 16:15:48:21
rightfully heralded as a world 16:15:52:27
class city and has been selected 16:15:54:15
as a host city the for the NAACP 16:15:55:24
convention in 2020, the minority 16:15:58:27
businesses in Boston continue to 16:16:00:24
bear the burden of not sharing 16:16:03:18
in the economic growth and 16:16:05:18
success realized in the city. 16:16:07:03
Collectively, we must do better 16:16:11:27

as a world class city. 16:16:14:18
And we would actually and the 16:16:16:00
city to reach out and impose the 16:16:17:15
inclusion requirements into the 16:16:22:12
private sector. 16:16:24:03
Right now, the minority 16:16:26:15
businesses are being left on the 16:16:28:06
side lines while the greatest 16:16:29:27
most continuous construction 16:16:31:24
boom in Boston's history 16:16:33:12
reporting \$21.5 billion in 16:16:35:06
construction last year continues 16:16:38:03
to shut out minority businesses 16:16:40:15
through the continued use of 16:16:42:21
obstacles to entry, a 16:16:44:03
allegations to minority 16:16:45:24
businesses do not exist and 16:16:46:27
acceptance of the usual excuses 16:16:49:09
for not contracting minority 16:16:51:06
businesses. 16:16:53:09
There has been a lot of talk of 16:16:55:24
inclusion but there has been 16:16:57:00
little real effort although I 16:16:58:15
was glad to hear about the 16:17:02:18
city's efforts to provide 16:17:04:06
technical support but really, 16:17:05:15
little real effort no tools, 16:17:08:12
training, mentorships, and joint 16:17:10:18
ventures to implement the 16:17:12:18
change. 16:17:14:24
>> I am submitting a copy of 16:17:15:18
this testimony for the public 16:17:18:12
record and offer the support of 16:17:19:09
MMCA and thank you for the 16:17:21:09
opportunity to speak to you 16:17:22:21
today. 16:17:23:24

>> Thank you, for your time and 16:17:24:21
attention and I look forward to 16:17:26:18
a copy of that testimony as 16:17:27:27
well. 16:17:29:00
>> Thank you. 16:17:29:12
>> Thank you. 16:17:29:24
Martin Evans? 16:17:31:21
>> Martin, welcome. 16:17:32:18
>> Thank you, guys and I will 16:17:33:21
try to be short. 16:17:35:03
I have never been a minority 16:17:36:24
vendor more, full disclosure, 16:17:38:24
one of the reasons is you would 16:17:41:03
probably starve to death, the 16:17:43:15
small amounts you get, I don't 16:17:44:24
know if anyone can live off of 16:17:45:27
ten percent. 16:17:47:21

I built my business and I took 16:17:48:12
business from Verizon and my 16:17:52:03
largest client was the United 16:17:54:09
States Marine Corps. 16:17:56:06
When I began to work for 16:17:57:21
accounting companies they would 16:17:59:00
bring us in to read RFPs for 16:18:00:03
people so I want to give you an 16:18:03:21
idea because someone will come 16:18:04:27
down and speak. 16:18:07:03
First, it is not profitable to 16:18:08:00
be a minority vendor. 16:18:09:15
You goes, the city of Boston has 16:18:12:24
done studies for probably about 16:18:15:06
25 years over and over and over 16:18:16:24
and over and over again and it 16:18:18:21
is really difficult, I am a 16:18:20:27
private investor, invest in real 16:18:23:06
estate, develop real estate, I 16:18:28:06
have never -- I have never 16:18:29:09
gotten anything under the 16:18:31:09
minority association. 16:18:32:18
I would just like for you boys 16:18:34:18
to really think about how 16:18:36:00
difficult the process is and for 16:18:38:00
someone like me when I was 16:18:41:15
starting out, well, at the 16:18:42:18
present time heads at these 16:18:45:06
large companies, they are being 16:18:47:00
sent to the Patriots games, the 16:18:48:15
Celtics games, little small 16:18:50:15
business owners can't compete 16:18:52:09
anyway. 16:18:54:06

Because it is not really apples 16:18:55:09
to apples a, and then you have 16:18:57:27
this process that someone brings 16:18:59:12
someone lick they, pays me \$300 16:19:00:24
an hour to read an RFP or do it 16:19:03:06
for them so they don't have that 16:19:05:24
ability either and then when I 16:19:08:03
think of a case study I was 16:19:09:15
thinking of Elizabeth Williams 16:19:11:18
company Roxbury tech. 16:19:13:00
Because you business say you 16:19:14:12
want to do, you know, local 16:19:15:18
businesses, who are, here is a 16:19:18:03
minority woman who built this 16:19:20:24
business, hired all residents 16:19:22:06
from Boston, was resold staples 16:19:23:21
products and the city of Boston 16:19:28:24
has never bought one sheet of 16:19:30:00
paper from her. 16:19:32:09
Staples hiring people to to 16:19:34:18

deliver in Framingham? 16:19:36:24
Pam Beth who is in Boston who 16:19:39:09
has a company in Boston, who all 16:19:41:15
of the employees are in Boston 16:19:44:24
paying Bostons taxes, she didn't 16:19:46:03
get a contract at all. 16:19:48:03
So I think really, you know, one 16:19:50:15
of the biggest problems is we 16:19:55:06
talk to each other over the real 16:19:56:15
people who this impacts. 16:19:58:18
I would love to see you bring 16:20:01:21
people in who are just starting, 16:20:03:15
not the professionals, not 16:20:05:12
someone like me or Joe but the 16:20:07:06
people who are just starting and 16:20:09:15
then ask them why they can't 16:20:11:03
eat, and then build policy based 16:20:13:18
on that. 16:20:16:12
We are sitting here talking to 16:20:19:06
each other and making each other 16:20:20:24
feel food but it doesn't impact 16:20:22:15
the real people down here. 16:20:24:03
They are never -- they never 16:20:27:18
feel included that's why people 16:20:29:00
don't vote, people don't feel 16:20:30:06
included, because it is us in 16:20:31:24
here talking. 16:20:33:27
Me and John, we both went to 16:20:35:09
Dartmouth and here we are 16:20:38:15
talking having fun. 16:20:40:09

The people at the bottom that 16:20:41:09
are really impacted you all 16:20:42:24
haven't heard from them. 16:20:44:24
Come in and Rhett them, let them 16:20:46:09
tell you why they can't compete. 16:20:48:06
And then look at when you award 16:20:50:24
these contracts, what is ten 16:20:53:24
grand going to do for somebody? 16:20:57:00
That doesn't encourage me to 16:20:58:18
have a business. 16:21:01:00
It doesn't. 16:21:03:12
So I would just say if you fizz 16:21:04:09
can really bring in those people 16:21:07:12
who don't know what they are 16:21:09:06
doing, who are fumbling, who 16:21:10:09
have never gotten a contract, 16:21:12:24
and just ask them why? 16:21:14:12
Figure that out and I know/foe 16:21:16:24
you have gotten some intel from 16:21:17:24
different people but that is 16:21:19:27
high level intel. 16:21:21:03
That's us talking to us. 16:21:23:12
One of the reasons I have never 16:21:25:24

done anything under the guise of 16:21:26:27
the city of Boston, I own 16:21:30:06
property when I sell them I call 16:21:31:18
Sheila Dillon and say may I have 16:21:33:12
got sticks units, if you want -- 16:21:35:15
if you have anyone that 16:21:37:12
qualifies I will give them to -- 16:21:38:12
I don't go to their program. 16:21:40:09
I just give them to them. 16:21:41:15
I get calls from city councilors 16:21:43:09
all the time saying hey I have 16:21:46:09
someone that actually last week, 16:21:47:24
someone is sleeping in the car. 16:21:49:21
I don't do it under the guise of 16:21:51:15
the city programs because they 16:21:53:27
don't make sense to me. 16:21:55:06
I would love for you all to talk 16:21:56:09
to the regular people, and by 16:21:58:00
the way, I know counselor Janey. 16:22:00:15
I have done a project on her 16:22:03:06
house, see her walking around 16:22:04:12
and talking to people. 16:22:06:21
I know she has her ears to the 16:22:07:18
ground. 16:22:09:21
And I know you guys do too. 16:22:10:06
But listen, these long meetings, 16:22:11:27
you all talking back and forth 16:22:16:03

and not bringing the people in 16:22:17:21
that are not making any money in 16:22:22:15
and listening to them first, 16:22:23:27
take that intel, glean it then 16:22:25:21
figure out why it is not 16:22:29:21
working. 16:22:30:27
There is no reason. 16:22:31:06
The city of Boston does an 16:22:34:24
excellent job of reach out to 16:22:36:09
people individually, it is just 16:22:38:15
the system doesn't work. 16:22:41:21
Individually if someone comes in 16:22:43:12
that can get your I go's 16:22:44:21
attentions, great, but the 16:22:46:27
system is built so that two of 16:22:49:21
us are going to make it, two of 16:22:52:18
us are going to have all of the 16:22:55:12
money in the minority process 16:22:56:27
and the rest are stalk, starving 16:22:59:09
and that's where the problem is, 16:23:02:00
is me and somebody else, and, 16:23:04:00
you know,, so we have to figure 16:23:05:27
out thousand spread this around 16:23:08:18
a and realize that \$10,000 16:23:11:15
contracts helps nobody. 16:23:13:24
As a matter of fact, by the time 16:23:15:09

they spend all of their money 16:23:16:06
buying equipment, and they get 16:23:17:09
that 10,000, it is nothing. 16:23:18:15
Thank you, guys. 16:23:20:27
>> Thank you. 16:23:21:18
>> Thank you, Martin. 16:23:22:09
Appreciate it. 16:23:23:12
Anyone else wishing to offer 16:23:24:12
public testimony may do so now 16:23:25:24
just step up to the Mike tone. 16:23:27:06
And please state your name and 16:23:28:21
affiliation for the record and 16:23:30:21
you have the floor. 16:23:32:03
Give us your thoughts. 16:23:33:00
>> Hi, councilor my name is 16:23:34:03
Michelle A Ferguson. 16:23:35:24
I am the owner of Hilton realty, 16:23:37:03
Inc. 16:23:39:18
I am here today because I want 16:23:40:06
to testify so I think this issue 16:23:42:18
is, Aness I appreciate this 16:23:45:00
council and appreciate you 16:23:48:06
holding this hearing but I think 16:23:49:09
this issue stretches beyond our 16:23:51:00

city. 16:23:52:27
It exists even when we try to do 16:23:53:27
business outside of the city. 16:23:55:21
So I am federally certified, my 16:23:57:18
business is also state 16:24:01:12
certified. 16:24:02:15
My city application and my zone 16:24:03:15
application are in processing 16:24:06:21
and I did apply to be a local 16:24:08:15
owned business, but I was denied 16:24:11:00
and I was not given a reason why 16:24:13:27
I was denied. 16:24:15:12
There was no feedback so I think 16:24:16:21
it is hard to defy one but not 16:24:19:09
tell them why you are denying 16:24:22:12
someone. 16:24:24:21
I don't know it is because my 16:24:25:06
business is only nine months old 16:24:26:06
or what it is from. 16:24:27:27
Continuing on, through waiting 16:24:31:24
cash so my business, I hired 16:24:35:12
employees, I lost those 16:24:38:18
employees pause we were waiting 16:24:39:18
on contracts and I could not 16:24:41:00
support -- so just to give you 16:24:42:15
to feedback this gentleman just 16:24:44:15
asked for, it takes time and 16:24:46:03
money, my time is more important 16:24:48:03
than my money, as a business 16:24:50:06

owner, I spend -- we are not 16:24:51:27
just like working on our 16:24:55:18
business, a lot of us are 16:24:56:24
working additional jobs as well. 16:24:57:27
So when you think about the time 16:25:00:03
that we are spending our time is 16:25:01:18
really important and systems 16:25:04:09
that like streamline our time 16:25:07:00
that we spend are extremely 16:25:09:09
helpful. 16:25:11:12
So I just want to talk about 16:25:12:09
very often the MWEs are the 16:25:17:09
first to feel and the last to 16:25:19:18
contract. 16:25:21:12
[fill] pairing business 16:25:22:06
coaches is a very good intention 16:25:24:00
and they are an outstanding 16:25:26:12
access to us. 16:25:29:06
However if I am in a real estate 16:25:30:00
business and paired with a 16:25:31:27
restaurant coach, there is a 16:25:32:27

learning curve when I am bidding 16:25:34:09
because I am bidding on real 16:25:38:06
estate contracts and the 16:25:41:12
restaurant individual may not be 16:25:43:06
familiar with those contracts. 16:25:44:15
Secondly, I think so there is 16:25:46:00
currently a mentor program that 16:25:49:24
is offered, however, you have to 16:25:50:27
be two years old in order to 16:25:53:24
participate in that mentor 16:25:55:15
program. 16:25:56:12
So we are leaving our youngest 16:25:57:12
businesses on their own to feed 16:25:59:09
them receives and we wonder why 16:26:03:21
there is like this small amount 16:26:05:06
of minority owned businesses. 16:26:06:18
I think, you know, doing that is 16:26:10:00
crippling us and it also is like 16:26:12:09
leaving a newborn on -- newborn 16:26:15:15
to nurse itself. 16:26:18:15
Like I think more -- I think you 16:26:19:21
should open up that mentor 16:26:21:21
program to at least the minority 16:26:23:03
owned businesses that are 16:26:25:06
struggling so hard so that we 16:26:26:12
can get the right mentorships 16:26:28:09
through all of these systems. 16:26:31:00
The other thing I wanted to 16:26:33:24
speak about was it is -- these 16:26:35:06
certifications are extremely 16:26:40:09
helpful, but it is a lot of work 16:26:41:18
to do these certifications 16:26:46:00

because you have to read up on 16:26:47:18
everything that is online. 16:26:49:12
You have to not only are you 16:26:50:18
working on the certification, 16:26:52:15
you are also preparing bids 16:26:53:27
proposals. 16:26:55:27
You are also registering your 16:26:56:27
business and you are also 16:26:58:18
watching the RFPs every single 16:27:00:12
day to -- thank you, Councilor 16:27:02:27
Wu for mentioning that, you are 16:27:04:24
watching the system and it is a 16:27:07:06
ton of reading and this is all 16:27:08:27
volunteer work for us. 16:27:10:15
We are not getting paid for any 16:27:12:03
of this so it is -- it would be 16:27:13:18
helpful if it was streamlined. 16:27:16:21
That way we wouldn't have to 16:27:18:24

process five different 16:27:20:06
certifications. 16:27:21:03
The other thing I think that 16:27:22:12
needs to be had is they should 16:27:24:06
test these IT systems before 16:27:26:24
releasing them. 16:27:29:09
There are a lot of systems that 16:27:30:21
have now been placed online and 16:27:32:12
that's great but they should 16:27:34:00
imagine that there is a person 16:27:36:12
that doesn't know that system, 16:27:37:27
having to? 16:27:39:09
It their application and if 16:27:40:00
there is a glitch in the system 16:27:42:03
meaning if there is a place in 16:27:43:18
the system that doesn't lead you 16:27:44:27
to where it is supposed to be or 16:27:46:09
where you can rationalize and 16:27:48:21
get to where you are supposed to 16:27:50:15
be without asking the help desk 16:27:52:21
for specified instructions, that 16:27:54:03
needs to be fixed. 16:27:57:21
Aside from that, I hate having 16:28:00:24
to say this, but, you know, 16:28:05:09
these are my people that are 16:28:07:12
going through this process and 16:28:08:27
it is very difficult for us, but 16:28:11:12
I think the people who are 16:28:12:24
helping us should be people who 16:28:15:03
are withinning. 16:28:16:12
I just -- I am not going to 16:28:18:21
mention the name of this 16:28:20:03
particular business, but I 16:28:21:03
received a very rude e-mail for 16:28:24:18
just asking what was included in 16:28:26:06

a meeting agenda, and it is like 16:28:28:03
when we are asking questions 16:28:31:06
like this, it is because as 16:28:32:12
business owners we have to curb 16:28:33:24
our time. 16:28:35:18
We can't -- I don't want to be a 16:28:36:09
busy body. 16:28:37:27
I want to actually be busy on 16:28:38:21
contracts. 16:28:40:24
I don't want to go to a million 16:28:41:12
meetings and have them feed me. 16:28:42:27
I want to actually go to the 16:28:44:21
right meeting so I can get with 16:28:46:18
the right people. 16:28:48:03
So when ski for agendas it would 16:28:49:06

be helpful if they could provide 16:28:52:09
them so having the right people 16:28:54:00
in the positioning, position 16:28:55:21
that understand we are in small 16:28:58:03
businesses and we don't know 16:28:59:18
everything, we are kind of 16:29:00:27
learning as we go, that would be 16:29:01:21
extremely helpful. 16:29:03:00
And before I end I just want to 16:29:06:15
say, and in regards to the 16:29:08:06
expenses that we incur going 16:29:10:27
through this bidding process, we 16:29:13:00
are not big corporations, we 16:29:14:27
don't have a big copier we can 16:29:16:24
go to and work on for free. 16:29:18:15
So even if we go to the public 16:29:20:24
libraries, we are spending money 16:29:23:03
when we apply for every single 16:29:25:03
bid and we are spending money on 16:29:27:21
plans, casino, scanning, and 16:29:29:03
most of all our time. 16:29:32:00
So I just wanted to make sure I 16:29:33:21
passed that, that along. 16:29:36:00
Also, since I have been in 16:29:39:03
business I have applied for 16:29:40:21
throw contracts, one with 16:29:42:00
Somerville, one with Brookline 16:29:43:18
and I have one in process for 16:29:45:06
maldin. 16:29:46:21
I put Malden. 16:29:48:03
I put a stellar contract 16:29:49:18
together for one of those 16:29:51:09
cities, and I was very hesitant 16:29:52:24
to include the address 16:29:55:12
information of that bid, right? 16:29:57:27
Because if I include the address 16:30:01:03
of the information of that bid 16:30:03:12
all of my hard work I put into 16:30:04:15

this -- I mean into this 16:30:05:27
proposal, someone can just come 16:30:08:06
up and take it from me. 16:30:10:00
They have the property address. 16:30:11:24
They know where to go and find 16:30:13:09
it. 16:30:15:03
It is a legal sale. 16:30:15:15
So I was extremely hesitant to 16:30:16:24
supply that information, because 16:30:19:15
the system is not structured in 16:30:22:24
a place where it protects us as 16:30:24:24
small business owners. 16:30:26:21

And that may be why so many MBEs 16:30:28:12
are dropping off. 16:30:32:21
Thank you for your time. 16:30:35:03
>> Thank you. 16:30:35:24
>> It is a very food point. 16:30:36:15
Anyone else wishing to offer 16:30:38:09
public testimony. 16:30:39:18
Come forward. 16:30:40:06
State your name and affiliation 16:30:41:03
for record and you the floor, if 16:30:42:06
any. 16:30:43:21